

龍樹與休姆對有神論的批判 之比較研究*

劉嘉誠

法光佛教文化研究所教師

摘要

關於神的存在之理論或對於創造神的信仰，在東、西方的神學思想或宗教信仰中，一向佔有舉足輕重的地位。然而重視以理性思辨來看待問題的哲學家們，對於有神論者的創造神論點，往往以嚴格的思辨角度來檢驗有神論者的主張。

*本文初稿曾發表於 2006 年 5 月台大哲學系、台大文學院佛學研究中心主辦「佛教哲學的建構學術研討會」，經修改後投稿本刊，承蒙二位不具名的審查委員惠賜卓見，以減少本文之疏漏，謹此致謝。

本文擬以英國經驗論者休姆(David Hume, 1711-1776)及印度佛教中觀學派鼻祖龍樹(*Nāgārjuna*, c.150-250)對有神論的批判進行比較研究,以探求這兩位東、西方哲學家對有神論的批判方法與哲學觀點及彼此之間相互契合的地方。休姆在《自然宗教對話錄》(*Dialogues Concerning Natural Religion*)中,曾以類比對象的相似性、推論上無窮後退的困難、神人相似論反證神的屬性不是無限、完善等觀點,對有關神存在的設計論證(**the argument from design**)進行批判,並從世界上惡的存在之相關道德論證,批判有神論者賦予神以全善全能的屬性。龍樹亦曾以和上述休姆相似的論證方法與觀點,在《十二門論》中批判所謂萬物起源於自在天所作之見解,在《中論》中批判有所謂即五蘊或離五蘊而獨立自存的神我(*ātman*)之見解。

比較龍樹與休姆對有神論的批判,我們發現兩人的批判方法與相關論點頗有異曲同工之處,而他們所表現出的默契則在於兩人都基於經驗主義和懷疑主義的立場,對東、西方所普遍存在的有神論觀點予以徹底的批判。

關鍵詞：

龍樹、休姆、有神論、設計論證、大自在天、神我

A Comparative Study on Nagarjuna's and David Hume's Criticism of Theism

Jia-cheng Liu

Lecturer

Fa-Kuang Institute of Buddhist Studies

Abstract:

Both the theory of the existence of God and the belief of the Creator have played pivotal roles in theological studies and religious beliefs in the East and the West. However, for philosophers who emphasize looking at problems by using rational thinking, they usually examine the views of theists from an angle of strict speculation.

This paper aims to give a comparative study on British empiricist David Hume's and the founder of Indian Buddhism Madhyamika Nagarjuna's criticism of

theism, so as to explore both the Eastern and Western philosophers' critical methods and philosophical views of theism, as well as the mutual compatibility of the above-mentioned methods and views.

Comparing Nagarjuna's and Hume's criticism of theism, it was found that their critical methods and related argument were quite similar. The tacit understanding between them showed that they both gave a thorough criticism of theism which was ubiquitous in the East and the West, with their standpoints based on empiricism and skepticism.

Keywords:

Nāgārjuna, David Hume, theism, the argument from design, the Supreme Being (Maheśvara) , the individual soul (ātman)