

Prof. Philip V. Bohlman 講座（音樂學研究所推薦邀請）

（一）前言

音樂學研究所承簡靜惠人文講座補助，於 2010 年 4 月至 5 月間邀請國際知名學者 Philip V. Bohlman 教授前來進行兩場系列演講。

Philip V. Bohlman 教授曾於 2005 年至 2007 年擔任美國民族音樂學會會長，亦於 2007 年獲英國人文社會科學院頒發 Derek Allen 獎，為國際音樂學界重量級學者。

Philip V. Bohlman 教授目前於芝加哥大學音樂系任教，在教學及研究方面均有卓越表現。Philip V. Bohlman 教授的研究領域相當廣泛，舉凡北美及歐洲的現代音樂、民族音樂、流行音樂、中東及南亞音樂、宗教音樂、殖民音樂等等皆屬於他的研究範圍。研究成果獨步全球，並受到相關領域學界肯定。

除了學者的身份之外，Philip V. Bohlman 教授也身兼鋼琴演奏家及芝加哥大學室內樂團藝術總監，對於藝術之推展不遺餘力。

（二）演講內容

第 1 場演講

講 題：Music and Its Meanings- Silence/Sound/Sublime

時 間：2010 年 5 月 3 日（一）19:00-21:00

地 點：洪建全教育文化基金會敏隆講堂

主持人：臺大音樂學研究所楊建章助理教授

譯 者：中央研究院民族學研究所呂心純助研究員

【演講全文】

- The aesthetic-ontological arc that my two NTU lectures form.
 - The keynote address also lies within that arc.
 - Today I reflect on the very being of music, above all as embodied sound which undergoes physical and metaphysical transformation to express the sublime.
 - With my second lecture on Friday, I follow the arc to its close, the ends of music, which I already today refer to as eschatology.

I. Sounding the Silence of the Sabbath Bride.

🌀 **Musical Ex. 1 – “L’cha dodi” / “Come, My Beloved” – Baghdadi tradition of the Jewish community of Kolkata** 🌀

L’chah dodi likrat kallah,	How good it is to thank the Lord,
P’nei Shabbat n’kab’lah.	To praise Your name, o God Most High:
L’chah dodi likrat kallah,	To tell your kindness through the day,
P’nei Shabbat n’kab’lah.	Your faithfulness when night draws night.

🌀 **Ppt 1 – Photo of the Beth El Synagogue in Kolkata** 🌀

A. I begin today with song that, in Jewish tradition, sounds the unseen body of the Sabbath Bride as she enters the synagogue to embody the very beginning of the Sabbath.

1. With “L’cha dodi,” worshipers greet the arrival of *Shechina* to gather the Jewish community in the synagogue on Friday-evening services.
 - a. Through song and ritual, the body of the Sabbath bride metaphorically joins together a larger community, that of Jews worshiping throughout the world in the chronotope, or time-space, of the Sabbath, in the opening example the Jewish community of Kolkata, which, as the ^cud announces, extended their diaspora to India from the ancient community of Baghdad, accompanying the British Empire in so doing.
 - b. Through song and ritual, that sacred body politic embodies with performance a complex network of beginnings and endings.
2. The Shechina is the “divine presence,” in other words, what we perceive as God, what we receive in human experience as the sacred.
3. Perceiving and receiving are themselves two different ways of translating *shema*, “giving voice and hearing voice,” and it goes without saying, therefore, that I turn to my opening example as a means of realizing metaphor in the complex ways music comes into being from silence through its connections to and resonance within the body.
4. More on the distinction between giving and hearing voice in a moment.
5. First, I turn to the arrival of Shechina, and I ask us to imagine the Sabbath Bride.

B. In synagogues throughout the world, on each Friday evening, worshipers gather in the sanctuary to pray and sing as means of issuing in the Sabbath.

1. The ritual of the Ma'ariv service that opens the Sabbath begins with gathering in the synagogue, the "house of gathering," or *bet kneset*, and the unfolding of liturgy.
2. After the community is gathered, it begins to sing the song, "L'cha dodi," usually glossed "Come, My Beloved," the welcoming of the Sabbath Bride.
3. The Sabbath Bride arrives metaphorically – or literally – by entering the rear door of the synagogue and passing along the central axis toward the front, that is, toward the ark, which lies at the eastern end of the synagogue, itself marking *mizrakh*, the East, or the direction of Jerusalem from the Mediterranean, Europe, and the Americas (toward the West in Taiwan or Hong Kong).
4. At the end of the Saturday services, that is, at the close of the Sabbath, at *motzeh shabbat*, the Sabbath Bride departs from the synagogue, passing westward from the front to the rear of the synagogue, symbolizing the transformation of the divine presence in the community to the divine presence in the sacred space that surrounds it.

C. The arrival of Shechina is musically mediated, one can say, performed in a neutral sense of that concept.

1. The congregants in the sanctuary turn toward the synagogue entrance and sing "L'cha dodi" as the Sabbath Bride arrives.
2. They then sing and follow her with their bodies in the course of her passage.
3. I should note, if it has not occurred to you already, that in traditional practice, and still today in orthodox practice, the "congregants" who greet the Sabbath Bride and accompany her with their bodies and song, are male.
 - a. The metaphor of the Sabbath "bride," therefore, has implications for the very realization of the sacred as a sort of consummation of the community.
4. Already, you gather that both Shechina and the metaphors used to represent her are female.
 - b. The divine presence is therefore female, but with a male counterpart,

Tiferet, or in the kabbalistic sense, *Berakha*.

D. We witness both a fabric of symbols and metaphors *and* the performative realization of them on the template of the body.

1. I use this opening example as a way of drawing our attention to the body as a vessel of mediation for transforming metaphor to practice in the crossing of the space between the divine and the human, no less than between silence and music.

2. Let's keep a couple things in mind:

a. Shechina is invisible and inaudible, which is to say, the divine presence enters the human sphere without physical-musical attributes of her own.

b. She receives her voice, nonetheless, through the performance of "L'cha dodi," which also makes that voice physical, which is to say, a physical presence.

3. We witness a ritual of giving voice and hearing voice, taking place in the liminal space of *communitas*, to borrow from ritual theory.

4. The invisible presence of Shechina serves as a type of musical mirror stage, in Lacanian terms, in which singing into the invisible and inaudible space occupied by the Sabbath Bride sonically realizes self-recognition as the vessel of the sacred.

5. It is that formation of the sacred in the physical vessel of the sounding body, that music mediates, that runs through my lecture today as a common thread.

E. The body as a sounding vessel has both literal and figurative presence at the moments of beginning and ending between life and death.

1. In Jewish tradition again, it is the body that becomes the vessel transforming the unsounded physical being into the sounding sacred musician.

a. In an etymological sense, the concept of klezmer reproduces this basic ontological understanding of the music making body.

b. A klezmer – *kleh* + *zemer* – is literally a "vessel of song."

2. The *bhajana*, or worshiping Hindu, is similarly the literal and physical "vessel" through which hymns of praise, *bhajans*, pass, say, for the pilgrims who embark along the sacred journey to the Ganges.

F. In this first of my lectures at the National Taiwan University, it is not by chance that questions of the sacred acquire greater importance.

1. When the body sounds silence to transform it through the humanness of the body's physical vessel, music comes into being.
2. The physicality of music as a realization of the sacred, furthermore, undergirds the structure of my lecture today.
3. The three larger parts of the lecture can be understood as representing birth, life, and death.
 - a. These, by extension, are represented metaphorically by the three concepts of musical being in my title, silence, sound, and sublime.
4. I hope you will join me, however, in understanding the parts not as bounded moments of physical existence, ultimately coming to an end, but rather as stages in processes of transforming the body, ultimately forming its sacredness.
5. We therefore layer metaphor upon metaphor, allowing us to reflect on Part 2, "Life," instead, as "sacred journey," and Part 3, "Death," as "transcendence from the body," as an expression of the sublime.
6. Beginnings and endings are thus rerouted, and the distinctions between them dissolve.
7. As with Shechina, the feminine presence of God and her metaphorical realization through song, the passage between the body as human and the body as divine will gather us again and again in song.

Part 1

II. Birth: Sounding the Body into Being.

A. Music sounds the body's silence.

1. Resounding on the walls of the vessel that each of us becomes is the voice of silence that we shape and make our own.
2. And then we sing it, move it, resonate sympathetically with it, until transformed to the music that we share with others.
3. The body is the musical vessel of wholeness, performed into its wholeness out of the fragments of silence.

4. Each fragment finds its way to that part of the body with which it is most resonant and consonant.
5. Together, the fragments of silence sing as the chorus of life.

B. In this first section of my lecture today, I turn to the ontological dimensions of music and the body.

1. I ask us to think about the metaphors for the emergence of music from silence as a body sounded into being.
2. The sounding of the body, I wish to suggest, results from the coherence of parts to form wholes, fragments of silence and sound that breathe life into the music-making body.
3. I proceed by journeying through different domains of metaphor that connect the parts to the whole, that afford the identity of individual selves.
4. These domains of metaphor connect the inner world to the outer world of selfness.
5. In other words, they begin with silence and transform it into the sound that gives meaning to the realization of human identities.

C. I feel I really must begin with the purveyor of bodily metaphors whose presence and whose reflections on silence are known to all of us: John Cage.

1. His willingness to claim silence as a condition for music notwithstanding, Cage openly recognized the paradox of the ways in which he asked his listeners to push at the boundaries of music.
2. Famously, he claimed in his book, *Silence*, that silence does not really exist.
3. And he turned to the body to justify that claim.

For certain engineering purposes, it is desirable to have as silent a situation as possible. Such a room is called an anechoic chamber, its six walls made of special material, a room without echoes. I entered one at Harvard University several years ago and heard two sounds, one high and one low. When I described them to the engineer in charge, he informed me that the high one was my nervous system in operation, the low one my blood in circulation. Until I die there will be sounds. And they will continue following my death. One need not fear about the future of music. (Cage 1961: 8)

D. In their pronouncement of paradox, Cage's remarks about the impossibility of silence are relevant for us today.

1. The sounds of the body, as he experienced them in an anechoic chamber or as each of us might experience them in our own bodies – the ringing in my ears of a mild case of tinnitus means that I am never left in silence – are determined by physical beings, by life itself.
2. He goes on to map a spiritual dimension on to physical life, noting that sound will transcend his own death, hence “one” – he, you, human beings – “need not fear about the future of music” (ibid.).
3. It is the very physicality of music that overcomes the psychological anxiety about the death of music.

E. The seemingly radical reach of his mapping of silence and sound on the body notwithstanding, John Cage re-sounds earlier aesthetic thought far more than sounding something entirely new.

1. The early-modern connections of musical attributes to the body are well known to all of us.
 - a. The expression of melancholy in music, to take the best-known example, results from the accumulation of those bodily fluids – generally a mixture of various so-called “biles” – that express themselves physically and emotionally.
2. That music flowed together with bodily essences is a concept found in the aesthetics of earlier Western tradition, but no less so outside the West altogether.
3. In the earliest forms of Sufism in Islam, for example, bodily fluids generate explicit structures of musical meaning.
 - a. We hear these clearly from the Ikhwan al-Safa in Basra, where the mixture of the humors effectively racialized the body.

Know my brother – may God assist you and assist us through the spirit [emanating] from Himself – the humours of the body have many different attributes, and the natures of animals are of many kinds. To each humour, to each nature, corresponds a rhythm and a melody,

whose number can only be counted by God, powerful and great. You will find the proof of the veracity of what we have just said and of the accuracy of what we have described if you consider that every people of the human race possesses its own melodies and rhythms, which are the delight and joy of its children, while nobody else finds any pleasure or joy in them. . . . [Y]ou will find, within one people, clans who take delight in certain melodies and certain rhythms, which bring joy to their souls, but nobody, other than they, would be able to find pleasure in them. . . . All these are a function of the variety of the mixtures of the humours, of the diversity of natures, of the constitution of the body, of places and of periods. (from "The Influence of Music on the Humours," in Shiloah 1978: 25-26; translation by Amnon Shiloah)

F. Music – and here I mean *musiqa* and *musiqi* as employed in early treatises, not *ghina*, as "song" – acquired much of its ontology from its metaphorical relation to the body.

1. The strings of the ^ʿud expressed its associations with the body.
2. Such relations owe an aesthetic debt to earlier Greek theory, and they emerge in roughly the ninth through the eleventh century as a record of encounter, not just between religions but also between musicians and intellectuals with the physical tools of science and the physical instruments of musical performance.

G. In Islamic religious tradition, the body transforms silence into sound in quite a different way, transferred from outside the body rather than from within.

1. According to tradition, it was the body of the Prophet, Muhammed, that became the vessel for revelation, when the word of God is literally – that is as letters on the unlettered Prophet's body – inscribed by the Angel Gabriel on the surface of the body, whence they metaphorically entered his body.
2. We witness the physical qualities of recitation ("qira'ah") in the accounts of the Qur'an's very revelation.

When it was the night on which God honoured him with his mission and showed mercy on His servants thereby, Gabriel brought him the command of God. "He came to me", said the apostle of God, "while I was asleep, with a coverlet of brocade whereon was some writing, and said, "Read!" I said, "What shall I read?" He pressed me with it so tightly that I thought it was death; then he let me go and said "Read!" I said, "What then shall I read?" He pressed me with it the third time so that I thought it was death and said "Read!" I said, "What then shall I

read?” – and this I said only to deliver myself from him lest he should do the same to me again.
He said:

Read in the name of thy Lord who created,
Who created man of blood coagulated.
Read! Thy Lord is most beneficent,
Who taught by the pen,
Taught that which they knew not unto men.

(Qur'an, Surah 96: 1-5)

So I read it, and he departed from me. And I awoke from my sleep, and it was as though these words were written on my heart. (Ibn Ishaq Muhammad 1955: 105-6)

H. The explicit understanding of the body as a vessel, which transforms silence to sound, internally and externally, remains crucial to the extensive history of transmission and perception, the crucial tenet of Islam that maintains the centrality of the Qur'an as an unchanging and spiritually unifying revealed text.

1. That assurance remains no less the case in practice than in theory.
2. We might look briefly at a learner's guide to *tajwid*, the "science of reciting the Qur'an" (*Ilm al-Tajwid*), this one by Muhammad Mutry and published in London.
3. The details of sound production – in other words, giving voice to the revealed text of the Qur'an – appear with phonemes and morphemes, the fragments of classical and qur'anic Arabic, mapped onto the organs of sound production.
4. We witness the vessel within the vessel, the believer's mouth within the believer's body, in consonance reciting and reinstantiating the revealed word.

🌀 **PPoint 2 – The Mouth and the Location of Mutry's Points of Sound Production** 🌀

🌀 **PPoint 3 – Chart with References to the Production of Phonemes and Letters** 🌀

I. Many of you will have noticed by now that there is a fair amount of slippage between my discussion of the body as physical object and metaphorical subject.

1. That slippage has been both intentional and unavoidable.
2. Indeed, the change of silence to sound mediates and depends upon slippage, or

at least the ontological transformation from musical dimensions inside and outside the body.

3. The performing body, therefore, assumes a subject position that alters the objective status of silence within the body.
4. In South Asian aesthetics, such transformation connects the physical and spiritual worlds through *rasa*, literally “the essence of taste,” but metaphorically a spiritual and aesthetic connection between the body and the cosmos.

J. The connective metaphors of *rasa* emerge already in the *Rg Veda* (ca. 1200–900 BCE) and receive their full enunciation in the *Natyashastra*, which took shape as a spiritual-aesthetic treatise between 400 BCE and 200 CE.

1. In most of its early forms, *rasa* participates in the performance of paradox, by way of its power to bridge inner and outer worlds.
2. In the *Rg Veda* it is the name of the river surrounding heaven and earth, separating the dwelling place of humans and gods from the non-space occupied by the demons (*The Rig Veda* 1981: 28, 29fn.).
3. In the *Natyashastra*, perhaps a millennium after the *Rg Veda*, abundant attributes of metaphor and paradox have accrued to *rasa*.
4. Kapila Vatsyayan summarizes these as follows:

It [*rasa*] proceeds through paradox: impersonality and intensity; the specific and the universal; the inner and the outer; the *bindu* (point) and its projection into infinite variety; stillness and movement; the physical body and its transcendence; the crucial nature of form, its development into a multitude of forms, and its final movement beyond form. (Vatsyayan 1996, quoted in Schwartz 2004: 14)

K. The crucial point for our considerations today is that *rasa* effects wholeness, and it does so by drawing the internal attributes of the body together with the external attributes of the spirit.

1. Musically, *rasa* realizes the threshold – the domain of transformation – between the inner and outer worlds of silence and sound.
 - a. It is in that domain that the sublime is realized.
2. In the *Natyashastra*, moreover, *rasa* assumes multiple forms, to be precise, eight

rasas, that connect the body in performance to specific deities (see PPoint 3).

“The Eight Forms of *Rasa* in the *Natyashastra*”

<i>Shringara</i> (love in union and separation)	Vishnu
<i>Hasya</i> (humor)	Pramatha
<i>Karuna</i> (pathos, sorrow)	Yama
<i>Raudra</i> (anger, wrath)	Rudra, but later Shiva
<i>Vira</i> (heroism)	Mahendra
<i>Bhayanaka</i> (fear/panic)	Kala
<i>Bibhatsa</i> (distaste/recoil/disgust)	Mahakala
<i>Abdhuta</i> (wonderment/surprise)	Brahma

❧ PPoint 4 – 8 Forms of *Rasa* ❧

L. The body comes into being sounding fragments into metaphor, which in turn coalesce as sound and music, the body, that is, as a whole.

1. The ways in which such fragments cohere as a sounding body connect mixed metaphor to mixed metaphor.
2. They also remind us of the formation of the *imago* from the reflective qualities of gaze Jacques Lacan describes in the “mirror-stage.”
4. Lacan writes in his central address on the “mirror-stage”:

I am led, therefore, to regard the function of the mirror-stage as a particular case of the function of the *imago*, which is to establish a relation between the organism and its reality – or, as they say, between the *Innenwelt* and the *Umwelt*. (Lacan 1989: 4)

5. Slavoj Žižek, not surprisingly, is even more willing to mix metaphors than Lacan, entitling one of his best known essays, “I Hear You with My Eyes” (Žižek 1996), and juxtaposing gaze and voice in counterpoint as connecting object to subject in human encounter (see, also, Žižek 1989).

M. Is there, we might ask, a sonic and musical equivalent of the Lacanian mirror-stage,

when we perceive self and self, *idiot* and *idem*, as belonging to ourselves?

1. Is this even possible, for example, when we find it often difficult to hear our own voice as emanating from our own bodies?
2. Or when we slip into a transcendent stage while performing and see ourselves standing apart, as if we were someone else, on the stage?
3. When the body in its wholeness sounds its fragments fully, the ontological stage that today comprises my first part, gives way to the processes that test the body's capacity to sustain life, often through another set of metaphors altogether, those of sacred journey, to which I now turn.

Part 2

III. Life: Moving along the Sacred Journey.

- A. The sacred journey of human life resonates in counterpoint with the passage of the human being through physical life.
 1. The sacred and the bodily realize and are realized through metaphor, but in the realization of life these metaphors intersect, transforming those who follow the sacred journey into pilgrims and performers, those who seek to sound the silence of the sacred in their lived-in worlds.
 2. How clearly I witnessed this at the end of January, when tens of millions of Hindu worshipers reached the shores of the Ganges for the Ardh Kumbh Mela Festival to purify their bodies, literally when covered with soil, in the holy waters.
 - a. The Hindu pilgrims purifying their bodies within and without, on the very surface of the skin and in the vessel formed by inner spirituality, became the very *bhajana* that performed the *bhajans* that remembered the genealogy of generations of pilgrims who had arrived from the same journey over millennia.
- B. For many, these sacred journeys may seem remarkable, displaced from modernity, distanced from daily life.
 1. Pilgrimage, the sacred journey, the physical instantiation of belief in the performing body of the believer, all these may seem to be otherworldly, sounded by the music of others.

2. In this section of my lecture, I should like to suggest – indeed, I should like to present as an article of ethnomusicological faith – that it is the very physicality of the sacred journey that draws it close to all of us.
 - a. We need but listen to the pilgrim’s song.

C. In my everyday world of Chicago, the pilgrim’s song is everywhere to be heard, and the sacred journey is anything but otherworldly.

1. I follow that sacred journey daily, commuting almost thirty kilometers on motorways with many of the hundreds of thousands of immigrants who share the roads with me as I travel to my place of work.
2. Each day, every day, I follow the vehicles of Mexican fellow travelers, who adorn their vehicles with the icon of the Virgin of Guadalupe, painted on their windows or the covers of spare tires on the back of conversion vans, or draped delicately around the mirrors through which they view those who gaze upon them suspiciously.
 - a. Guadalupe in Mexico is, of course, the largest site of pilgrimage in the world.
 - b. For Mexican-Americans in Chicago, Guadalupe is a site of daily worship and, in massive numbers, of annual pilgrimage.
3. Shrines to the Virgin of Guadalupe remap the quotidian journeys we follow in Chicago.
 - a. Each year, miracles and visions appear on the concrete walls of motorway underpasses.
 - b. For days and weeks, these shrines – an image of the Virgin of Guadalupe weeping for the struggles of immigrants, anguished by the disproportionate loss of Hispanic-Americans in the Iraq War – slow and halt traffic.
 - c. For a moment, the pilgrim’s voice is raised in song.

C. In Chicago, the pilgrim’s voice increasingly joins in chorus to mobilize the sacred journey that performs the history of the present.

1. The chorus of pilgrims sings for solidarity and for immigrant rights.
2. It takes to the streets as it takes over the streets of the city, connecting them to

- Guadalupe itself.
3. Chicago, not surprisingly, has become one of the most visible and vocal, dare I say, choral, of the American centers for advocating immigrant rights, equality for all who pass together on the routes constituting life's journey.
 4. Each day, every day, those routes intersect also as the pilgrim's journey between Guadalupe and Chicago.

↪ PPoint 5 – May Day March in Chicago 2006 ↪

D. I turn now briefly to pilgrimage and music because of my own personal and professional engagement with it over the past twenty years.

1. It is no less crucial, particularly as we consider the silence of the body, that I draw us closer to the ethnographic moments from which these reflections grow.
2. In the case of my pilgrimage research, moreover, my physical presence in the field has more than passing significance.
3. As I articulate a set of connections between the inner and outer worlds of the body, as I ask us to consider how the body becomes a musical vessel for shaping voice, I cannot avoid my own presence as a fellow traveler on the pilgrim's sacred journey.
4. It is on the sacred journey itself, moreover, that we experience the confluence of aesthetics and politics, the two larger themes that run through these lectures.
5. I begin with the beginning of my own journeys.

E. In September 1993, I took part in a number of pilgrimages in Central Europe, the timing of which clustered around the Marian holidays that stretch from mid-August until the end of September.

1. In Central Europe, soon after the transition from communism in Eastern Europe, there was an explosion in the sheer number of pilgrimages, particularly those that plied and crossed the borders that had previously divided Europe.
2. Pilgrimage in Europe underwent a revival, one which has not abated until the present.

↪ Musical Ex. 2 – “Medjugorje Song” (German pilgrim choral tradition) ↪

3. The revival itself will not return at as subject in my lectures, not least because the way it intersects with larger soteriological themes of the sublime in sacred revival.
4. For now, I want to turn to the question of the body, the human and sacred body, and its role as a vessel for sacred music.

F. Late in September, at the time of the autumnal equinox, I joined a foot pilgrimage in the Styrian Alps that was officially organized by the Austrian Folk-Dance Society, an amateur organization, which nonetheless drew upon professional and semi-professional musicians.

1. Though clearly secular in its organization and usual functions, the folk dancers engaged a priest to lead them on their pilgrimage, which stretched over some three days and culminated in the major center of pilgrimage in Central Europe, Mariazell.
2. They also engaged musicians to accompany them on their pilgrimage, largely from the surrounding Slavic lands, but also from Hungary and Austria.
3. The musicians automatically gave the pilgrimage the feeling of a multicultural event, and this was complemented and amplified by the priest's adaptation of a political theme, the "Woche der Ausländer," to cast the pilgrimage as a movement "gegen den Stroh" ("against the stream") of present European history.
4. This was the backdrop, one which was deeply contextualized by Mariazell's long history of serving pilgrims from diverse cultural, linguistic, and musical traditions in East and Central Europe.

G. There is but one moment, however, that I want to discuss with you, one which ultimately.

1. During the final day and final stations of the cross along the concluding foot pilgrimage, a film crew from Austrian television (ORF) had joined the pilgrims, usually zooming ahead to a station of the cross to film the songs and liturgies that gathered meaning during worship when the pilgrims stopped at the station.
 - a. The pilgrims were largely oblivious to the film crew, though several did speak with me about their fear that the ORF crew failed to capture the sacred qualities of the pilgrimage.
 - b. The ORF crew had come to symbolize the intervention of the secular,

- and, through a sort association, my presence was thrown into question.
- c. Was the ethnomusicologist one of us or one of them?
 - d. Was he a participant observer, also in matters of faith, or was he simply documenting the event for others, in North America, to read?
2. At the final event in Mariazell, the major dance that followed the concluding mass, I was approached by the film-maker and asked if I might give an interview for the film, which, we all knew, would be broadcast on Austrian television, and perhaps beyond on one of the affiliate networks, 3-Sat or the EBU.
3. I consented, and the interview proceeded, at first along more or less predictable lines.
- a. Then came the really crucial question: Do you think the pilgrims really believe that healing has taken place?
 - b. The question was posed in such a way that I was acutely aware that the film-maker wanted me to provide the ethnomusicological or scientific answer.
 - i. Either an equivocal “well, healing takes place if the pilgrims think it takes place”;
 - ii. Or the quasi-psychoanalytical “well the healing of their spiritual well-being can actually produce physical well-being.”
 - c. The film-maker was sympathetic with the pilgrims, but he did not know how to represent the deeper levels of belief, the real motivation of many pilgrims who turned to pilgrimage for physical transformation and healing.
4. Put on the spot, I actually did not equivocate.
- a. I stated that I had witnessed healing and remarkable physical transformation.
 - b. I gestured even to the intense dancing that the film crew had used as background to ask how such remarkable physical vigor was even possible at the end of the third day of a foot pilgrimage.
 - c. I pointed out how the elderly and the infirm often served as the leaders of a pilgrimage.
 - d. I attempted to provide a symbolic interpretation of the store of crutches and other relics of healing that fill the pilgrimage chapels in the Alps.
5. In short, to respect the beliefs of my fellow pilgrims, I came myself to believe in

the very real transformation of the body that occurred during pilgrimage.

☞ **Musical Ex. 3 – “Radnalied” (Banat Germans in St. Peter)** ☞

H. The awareness of healing in pilgrimage is deeply physical within a belief system that interweaves the concepts of “holiness” and “healthiness,” in German, “heilen” and “heilig.”

1. The major Catholic pilgrimage centers in Europe, Lourdes and Santiago de Compostela, for instance, are surrounded by hospitals and clinics.
2. The juxtaposition of health and holiness is also a factor in the journey itself, which is never easy, requiring days, sometimes months, on foot, and complicated by practices such as taking the final stages on one’s knees.
3. The healing potential of waters – springs, the fluids of miracles, etc. – are further prerequisites for the confluence of health and holiness.
4. The political meaning of pilgrimage, finally, encodes and expresses healing, again giving meaning to the sublime.

I. Pilgrimage does not happen without music.

1. More than anything, music transforms the physical and temporal world in which pilgrimage takes place.
2. Music leads to the creation of a new physical world, setting up a metonymic field in which the sacred journey of life is realized through pilgrimage.
3. Music provides the social glue for turning pilgrims as a group into a community worshipping together.
4. Music provides symbolic languages that connect the sacred and the profane, the world articulated through worship and the world articulated by everyday needs.
5. The pace of walking, the beat of the heart, the return of the body to health and well-being, all these are encoded by the music of pilgrimage.

J. The role of music in pilgrimage, thus, has its most direct impact on the body itself.

1. The music of pilgrimage is literally embodied and expressed through the body.
 - a. During the march through the mountains of Central Europe the rosary may be recited again and again, affording the weary body the chance of

- moving effortlessly forward toward the goal of faith.
2. The music of pilgrimage maps place, the path and stations along which the pilgrim passes.
 - a. Hindu bhajans, songs for hajj, and Buddhist mantras can all be specific in their geographical references.
 3. We hear the sense of the physical journey in an audio example with which I close the second part of today's lecture, gathered from the digitized colportage I encountered on my most recent pilgrimage, to Jasna Góra at Częstochowa, to the Black Madonna, in southern Poland.
 4. I took this pilgrimage at a time of great political significance and religious meaning, joining a group of pilgrims from the village of Wadowice, in which Pope John Paul II had grown up, only three and a half months after his death.
 5. As with the Chicago Mexicans who venerate the Virgin of Guadalupe, with which I began this section on sacred journey, the pilgrimage to Jasna Góra in Częstochowa connected inner and outer worlds, the physical journey in song from the Black Madonna to the Chicago, the largest Polish city in the world.
 6. In this lecture it metaphorically reaches the threshold of the sublime.

↻ **Musical Ex. 4 – “Wadowice Song” (CD from Jasna Góra)** ↻

Part 3

IV. Death: Music and Islam / Music and the Radically Other Body.

- A. The body sounded into being from the silence of fragments may often resonate with a radical otherness, generating the anxiety of witnessing the disintegration of the familiar body of selfness.
 1. The wholeness constituted of fragments, which we have followed through today's lecture, is itself fragile, yielding precariously to fragmentation.
 2. The healing that provides the telos to the sacred journey proves to be temporary, poised between the eschatological moment and the soteriological return that can only follow upon dissolution.
 3. The anxiety of such healing and wholeness, the fear of the body rendered unwhole and unholy, generate responses that are repulsed by otherness,

yielding to racism and ultimately to death.

4. Jacques Lacan pushes the consequences of such anxiety even farther, into the realm of a pathology born of representing the body's disintegration.

This fragmented body – which term I have also introduced into our system of theoretical references – usually manifests itself in dreams when the movement of the analysis encounters a certain level of aggressive disintegration in the individual. It then appears in the form of disjointed limbs, or of those organs represented by exoscopy, growing wings and taking up arms for intestinal persecutions. . . . But this form is even tangibly revealed at the organic level, in the lines of “fragilization” that define the anatomy of phantasy, as exhibited in the schizoid and spasmodic symptoms of hysteria. (Lacan 1989: 5)

5. With the telos of today's lecture rerouted to a border region shaped by anxiety for otherness, I turn now to the fragmented body and the disembodiment of music to return it to silence, the themes constituting part three.

B. To illustrate the anxiety that grows from the fragmentation that undoes the wholeness of the body, I return again to Islam, which provides one of the thematic threads that runs through all my lectures.

1. Different aesthetic realizations of the body complicate the ways in which the body has been claimed to widen the gulf between the West and its other, Islam, not least through the use of music for torture by the West, as we witnessed in last week's lecture.
2. The body is the site of misunderstanding, exacerbated because it now has become politicized by violence.
3. The anxiety toward Islam – religiously, politically, musically – arises from the very problem of perceiving wholeness, above all the wholeness of a body politic, which is represented repeatedly in the history and aesthetics of the West, as fragmented.
4. If we listen, however, we perceive a sounded aesthetic that coheres in ways that, however radically different, are shaped through the body's vessel of wholeness.

C. Let's return briefly to the *sama*^c polemic, the distinction between two different processes of physically perceiving music.

1. The Arabic word, *sama*[°], has two meanings, “hearing” and “listening,” thus revealing two distinct ways in which we perceive music.
2. *Sama*[°] concentrates the experience of music on the human body.
3. To know music, therefore, requires that one understand the body, indeed, to understand it through a multitude of sensations.
4. The sensation of sound is primary among these, but it cannot act in an isolated manner.
5. Through *sama*[°] music acquires the form of the human body, expressing the aesthetic dimensions of beauty that aspire to physical perfections.
6. One of the earliest testaments to the embodied nature of music was formulated by the great fourteenth-century polymath, Ibn Khaldun (1332-1406), who turned to music in his *Muqaddimah*, his “Introduction” to a universal science of history, at several crucial points.

The object that is most suited to the human and in which he or she is most likely to perceive perfect harmony, is the human form. Therefore, it is most congenial to the human to perceive beauty and loveliness in the lines and sounds of the human form. Thus, every human desires beauty in the objects of vision and hearing, as a requirement of human nature. Beauty in the objects of hearing is harmony and lack of discordance in the sounds. (Ibn Khaldun 1967: 329-30)

- D. The *sama*[°] debate also raises questions about embodiment and disembodiment.
1. The question of music and the sanction of experiencing otherness has arisen already in my first two lectures, devoted to being and encounter.
 2. We remember that there is a general use of the aesthetics of *sama*[°] to explain why musicians in many Muslim societies are non-Muslims.
 3. Christian Armenians are exceptional instrument makers, and Jews perform in large numbers at Muslim courts, because they are the producers of music.
 4. Muslim listeners are not implicated in any violation of presumed proscriptions against music because their experience of music is that of listening, *sama*[°].
- E. The *sama*[°] debate relates to the body in very complex ways.
1. From one set of perspectives, the function of the debate itself is to redeploy

music on the body so that it does not have abstract or representational qualities.

2. This is the dilemma: How to deploy music so that it does not represent the body and the characteristics of the body.

F. Let's remember for a moment several aspects of aesthetics in Islam (or for that matter early Christianity or Buddhism) that account for ontological space between embodiment and disembodiment.

1. First of all, the body should not be represented, as an icon or for its physical beauty.
2. Second, physical beauty, or beauty that has an impact on the body, is improper.
 - a. It is improper, however, because of the ways in which it distracts from the other functions of sacred art.
 - b. The function of sacred sound is to draw attention to the word of God, the revealed text of the Qur'an above all.
 - c. Recitation of the Qur'an may have "musical" characteristics, but only if these do not detract from perceiving – here is where *sama*^c literally enters – the meanings in the Qur'an.
 - d. The exact maqam or the nature of musical form and structure, therefore, must remain entirely secondary to the clarity of recitation.
3. Third, beauty itself is not forbidden, but rather it has its appropriate place.
 - a. The site of production of women's music behind the burka or behind walled communities is not anti-beauty, rather it is a location of the woman's beauty in the sanctity of a sanctioned social and aesthetic place.
 - b. That different aesthetic and sacred histories were otherwise deployed will already have occurred to you as you reflected upon the woman singer from the Baghdadi-Indian tradition who opened my lecture today.
4. Fourth, there is a deployment of aesthetic beauty on surfaces rather than in spatial locations that might be considered embodied.
 - a. The figuration of text on a mosque or the melodic improvisation in sacred musical genres (*'ayali/qasida*) serve as striking examples.

G. Knowing the deployment of music on the body is crucial to understanding the

aesthetic dimensions of sama^c.

1. Please remember the presentation of the body in Muhammad Surty's *The Science of Reciting the Qur'an* ('Ilm al-Tajwid), with which I illustrated the first part of today's lecture.
2. Think, too, of the ways in which "reading" (qira'ah) provides the basis for for musical enunciation, crucially a physical experience.
3. In the long history of Islamic treatises on music the body is also presented as the site for musical beauty, but through the processes of perception.
 - a. Beautiful musical sound connects the listener to the beauty of the body.
 - b. Yet, beauty also has proportions, mathematically and otherwise in the body.
4. For Sufism, too, music becomes the site of music making, but the measure of efficacy is the transformation of the body.

H. How differently the body functions in the orientalist encounter I described in my lecture for the conference.

1. Beauty is exoticized in order to be enhanced for the Western gaze, deflected rather than reflected through the mirrors of perception.
2. There is no other place of greater orientalist anxiety than the body.
3. One might argue that the original theme of modern archeological orientalism was the body in the form of the mummy.
4. Orientalist anxieties extend also to the representational practices of the Egyptian past, not least, to hieroglyphics and its inscription of bodies.

I. At the beginning of his 1978 book, *Orientalism*, as we all remember, Edward Said takes great pains to insist that the entire orientalist project was political.

1. The orientalist project was not primarily about representation but rather about the use of power, ever more completely driving the wedge between self and other.
2. "Indeed, my real argument is that Orientalism is – and does not simply represent – a considerable dimension of modern political-intellectual culture" (Said 1978: 12).
3. In no uncertain terms, Said is arguing in 1978 that we have no choice but to

be swept up in orientalist projects.

4. Once the space between self and other forms through encounter, orientalism is inescapable.
5. It is the space of fragmentation, of disembodiment, of death.

J. The body as a political and aesthetic subject enacting death at encounter provides the central metaphor and theme in Mohsen Makhmalbaf's 2001 film, *Kandahar* (music by Mohammad Reza Darvishi) so trenchantly, indeed, that I show a brief clip from the film to close the third part of my lecture today.

1. The loss of the body – or body parts – runs through the entire film, posing question after question about the wholeness of the body and of course of Islam and Afghanistan.
2. The representational issues of the film are very complex, not least because it relies extensively on the iconic and representational power of film to mediate beauty (“The Sun behind the Moon” is the subtitle).
3. The question of penetrating the surface, for example, of the *burka*, is rendered as complex as possible.
4. Beauty is constantly deployed and redeployed to different parts and images of the body.
5. And so, too, is music.

K. Music is present throughout, but in a relatively subdued way.

1. In the fifth scene, however, the deployment of music on the body is really crucial, and I should argue symbolically central to the meaning of the film.
 - a. It is a modern variant enacting the *sama*^c debate.
2. In a word, music moves to different sites on the body throughout the scene, from ears to mouth to different genders and from sacred to secular, from life to death.
 - a. Music is envoiced and mediated, in fragments that await perception, that are suspended by *sama*^c.
 - b. Music searches for its place on the body, never truly achieving it, hence remaining in a state of displacement.
 - b. Ultimately, the film itself is about displacement, the failure to find a

place of rest after being dislodged through encounter with the West
and its destruction of the body of most radical otherness.

↪ **Video Example Ppt – *Kandahar*, scenes 4 & 5 (Khak in the madrasa; Nafas begins her
journey of healing into Afghanistan) ↪**

V. Transcendence: Music Sounding beyond the body.

“Dunkles zu sagen” / “Darkness Spoken”

Ingeborg Bachmann

Wie Orpheus spiel ich	Like Orpheus I play
auf den Saiten des Lebens den Tod	death on the strings of life,
und in die Schönheit der Erde	and to the beauty of the Earth
und deiner Augen, die den Himmel verwalten,	and your eyes, which administer heaven,
weiß ich nur Dunkles zu sagen.	I can only speak of darkness.

...

...

Die Saite des Schweigens	The string of silence
Gespannt auf die Welle von Blut,	taut on the pulse of blood,
Griff ich dein tönendes Herz.	I grasped your beating heart.
Verwandelt ward deine Locke	Your curls were transformed
Ins Schattenhaar der Nacht,	into the shadow hair of night,
der Finsternis schwarze Flocken	black flakes of darkness
beschneiten dein Antlitz.	buried your face.

...

...

Aber wie Orpheus weiß ich	But like Orpheus I know
auf der Seite des Todes das Leben,	life on the side of death.
und mir blaut	and the deepening blue
dein für immer geschlossenen Aug.	of your forever closed eye.

(Bachmann 2006: 10-11; translated by Peter Filkins)

A. Moving through and moved by the mixed metaphors in Ingeborg Bachmann’s poem,

“Dunkles zu sagen / Darkness Spoken,” I close today’s lecture by setting a new counterpoint in motion, between hesychasm and transcendence.

1. In Orthodox Christian thought, with an historical indebtedness to Buddhism, hesychasm is the stillness of contemplating the body’s physical passing that accompanies death.
2. Transcendence, similarly, springs from a capacity to escape the physical vessel of the body and to do so as the sublime.
3. By weaving them in counterpoint, I mix metaphors, as does Bachmann in one of her greatest poems, one of her most profound autobiographical expressions.
4. To “speak darkness” is to envoice death and to create the possibility of hearing its silence.
5. The lyre’s string sounds with the sounding of the heart, the vessel that Orpheus knows on both sides of death.
6. Hesychastic contemplation, too, allows us to hear the stillness of the dying body.
7. The transcendence of the sounding body begins on one side of death and re-sounds on the other.

B. It should be inevitable in a lecture on silence, sound, and sublime that it ends as it begins, musically contemplating silence.

1. We began today with the contemplation of *shechina*, the invisible and inaudible essence of the feminine attributes of God.
2. We close with images of death made visible and audible after being stripped of life.
3. The counterpoint of hesychastic and transcendent soundings of the silent strives toward the stretto of the eschatological moment, from which they will liberate music, but only after the experience of death.

C. We, too, have reached that eschatological moment, and we enter it fully in four days with the second of my lectures at the National Taiwan University.

1. We return once again to the political, if indeed the political also haunted my aesthetic considerations today, as well as my Sunday keynote.
2. Encounter, too, returns, in two days with renewed emphasis on empire and its destructive impact on the bodies of those it subjugates.
3. Music, too, will sound the silence of utopia, speaking darkness with its companion,

dystopia.

4. We shall witness again how power accrues to the sublime, through its capacity to sound silence as music, at once unleashing awe and wonder.

第 2 場演講

講 題：Music and Its Meanings- Utopia/Dystopia/Heterotopia

時 間：2010 年 5 月 7 日（五）14:00-17:00

地 點：臺灣大學文學院會議室

主持人：臺大音樂學研究所王櫻芬教授

【演講全文】

- Phil Bohlman projects that converge in this presentation
 - Religion and music, confluence of sacred and secular space
 - “Music in the European Age of Islam”
 - Three terms: utopia, dystopia, heterotopia and the Three-City Project
 - Many projects converge: European nationalism, Eurovision, religion and the arts
 - Ultimately, this talk today serves as a witness to my commitment that “thinking about music” is never separate from “acting with music.”
 - Religion and music: Eschatology and soteriology as new paradigms for the global metropole and its music.

Avant propos

- This contribution to my lectures this week in Taiwan combines historical and ethnographic, projects aimed at understanding music and the formation of modern Europe and modern European thought.
- In this talk, however, I want to draw upon considerable thinking I have done on the city, that is, the global and cosmopolitan city in which music acts on history in critical ways.
 - Whether Beirut, Taipei, or Shanghai, the global city becomes a sound space for the experience of music as an active presence in the ways humans create their own subject positions.
 - For some time we have been contesting and criticizing traditional categories,

of musical epistemologies of space and place, but it is precisely contestation and criticism that I wish to call into being as essential tasks of modern ethnomusicology, particularly when it becomes a disciplinary partner with historical musicology, music analysis, and folklore.

- Also, the question of religion and theology looms large, perhaps echoing what should be increasingly obvious: Religion has become inseparable from our postmodern sense of self, place, and nation.
 - Utopia, as I discuss it, is a place of *theos* and the *polis*.
-
- In projects such as my translation of Johann Gottfried Herder's writings on music and nationalism, I am concerned largely with genre, for example with epic as an historical and modern discourse about Europe, say in the epic of *El Cid*.
 - Today, I turn to the place of music, to the city and to city music, and by extension what I should call musical cosmopolitanism, in which music configures space through its mobility.
 - The location of music in cities – the emergence of “city music” – becomes increasingly central in the making of modern European culture.
 - The court and the church, the orality of multiple vernaculars, all these give way to the city with early modernism.
-
- The idea of utopia, which provides me with a discursive, conceptual core, also grows from the moment in which the early modern music culture arises through globalization and cosmopolitanism.
 - Utopias intervene in the spaces between city culture – and music – as it is practiced and as it is idealized.
 - Modern Europe becomes an idea in response to utopian thought, but that response can hardly be idealized in practice.
 - I shall be keen to think about such categories when thinking about East Asian city music, and I welcome your discussion later.
 - It collapses into a Europe that is dystopian, in which city music collapses into the signification of destruction and the end of history.
 - The utopian-dystopian border, I argue, increasingly separates Europe from its Other, which in the formation of modern Europe, means along the cultural

boundaries along the south – the Mediterranean, Africa, the Middle East, and Islam.



Accordingly, two cities have been formed by two loves: the earthly by the love of self, even to the contempt of God; the heavenly by the love of God, even to the contempt of self. The former, in a word, glories in itself, the latter in the Lord. For the one seeks glory from men; but the greatest glory of the other is God, the witness of conscience. The one lifts up its head in its own glory; the other says to its God, “Thou art my glory, and the lifter up of mine head” (Psalm 3, 3).

St. Augustine, *Civitas dei*, Book 14, Chapter 28

Herzen: We belong to Egypt, not to the Promised Land. The people faltered. I wouldn't insult them by absolving them. They had no programme, and no sovereign brain to carry one out. The Sovereign People are our invention. The masses are more like a phenomenon in nature, and nature isn't interested in our fantasy that ink is action.

Tom Stoppard, *The Coast of Utopia Part II, Shipwreck* (2002), p. 80

Miranda:

O, wonder!

How many goodly creatures are there here!

How beauteous mankind is! O brave new world

That has such people in't!

(William Shakespeare, *The Tempest*, V.i.181-4)

I. Approaching the Coast of Utopia.

❖ Powerpoint 1 & 2 – Photos of Beirut, Gabriele Basilio ❖

A. Among the works attracting attention at the 2007 Biennale de Venezia were the photographs of bombed-out buildings in Beirut, taken by the Italian architectural photographer, Gabriele Basilico, and exhibited in the Arsenale.

1. Basilico's Beirut series already has acquired a history of its own, beginning in 1991 and stretching to the present, punctuated always by the temporality of its subject, the destruction and reconstruction of buildings in one of the Mediterranean's most cosmopolitan and most fragile cities.
2. Basilico's Biennale exhibit connected that Mediterranean city to another, Venice, using art, in this case photography, to link cities and to recalibrate history.
3. The images of a destroyed Beirut, thus, underwent a transformation that restored them in Venice, that afforded them a wholeness that symbolically asserts the ways in which their cosmopolitanism survives time itself.
4. The Mediterranean city, once, indeed, continuously destroyed, reclaims its past as its future.
 1. The dystopian rubble of the city lends itself to constant reimagination as a utopian future in which Beirut might again be reinhabited.
5. For Gabriele Basilico, the space of the Mediterranean is at once framed by the multiple forms of its cosmopolitanism and opened by the migration of image and sound between its cities.
6. Venice becomes the site for experiencing Beirut, which becomes the site for experiencing Jerusalem, which in turn sets diasporas and pilgrimages in motion that traverse the Mediterranean in search of other "coasts of Utopia" (Stoppard 2002).
 1. That these also extend to East Asia – not least in the historical narratives of Marco Polo and the Silk Road – surely challenges me and us to think about the very city in which we now find ourselves, Taipei.
 2. For my own work, to this point, the Mediterranean provides a point of arrival and departure.

- B. Gabriele Basilico's concern for the historical and geographic spaces between Mediterranean cosmopolitanism and migration will provide me, too, with a set of metaphors that allow me to think about the cities of the Mediterranean as a whole.
1. Connecting the cities, linking their urban spaces as Saskia Sassen would say, is the search for utopia in the Mediterranean, a search that has inspired the

ways in which the city has come to rise along the Mediterranean's shore and to form the telos for the journey from the everyday to the future (Sassen 2002).

2. In the historical *longue durée* of the Mediterranean the search for utopia has motivated action, and no site has exerted greater pressure on the utopian movements that attempt to claim the Mediterranean than the city and the migration movements that create cities anew.

3. Jerusalem and Beirut, Istanbul and Venice, Alexandria and Rome, Atlantis and Lisbon.

a. Pasts and futures mix the very meaning of cosmopolitanism and migration.

C. Today, I ask us to consider the utopianism of the global metropole in quite traditional ways.

1. On one hand, my primary theoretical models are those Saints Augustine and Thomas More, whose aims were theological.

a. The ideas of the Mediterranean and Europe are profoundly religious, and I do not shy from considering their interconnections and intersections from theological perspectives.

b. Pilgrimage, crusades medieval and modern, epics about the Cid and the Bene Hillal in North Africa, all these serve as religious discourses for the music of the Mediterranean.

2. On the other, I draw upon more modern writing on utopia, Theodor Herzl's *Altneuland* (1904) and Fredric Jameson's *Desire Called Utopia* (2005), where social and socialist thought provide motivation.

D. It is by treating the work on utopianism as traditional that I expand my interpretive framework to include dystopia and heterotopia.

1. I therefore treat Thomas More quite literally, reminding us that his *eutopia* meant "no place," and that the island he called utopia resulted from a flight of literary fancy.

a. Utopia that is "real," therefore, exists only at another time and place.

2. St. Augustine, too, divides his *civitas dei* between two cities, one of the flesh

and one of the soul, ultimately of the self and of God.

3. The cosmopolitanism of the utopian city is unachievable.
4. What happens along the path toward utopia – what can be achieved – are its states of reality, and these I shall be calling dystopia and heterotopia.
5. It is in these states that the imagined unity of utopia – all cities on More's island of Utopia are the same, we should not forget – give way to the difference that dominates dystopia and heterotopia.

E. Throughout my remarks today, I trace the cosmopolitanism of Mediterranean music through a series of pairs, with one component modified by more idealized dimensions, the other altered by earthly dimensions.

1. Utopia and the *civitas dei* provide my first pair.
2. Then dystopia and the *entrepôt*.
3. And finally, heterotopia and the *banlieu*, the working-class suburb of Paris inhabited by North African immigrants.
4. We turn first to the most sacred realization of utopian cosmopolitanism, utopia and its counterpart, the city of God.

II. Utopia – The City as Shrine and Pilgrimage Site.

❖ Audio Example 1 (PPT 3 & 4) – Fairuz: “Al-Quds al-Atiqa” ❖

A. In the vast majority of songs about Jerusalem, the city virtually epitomizes the utopian city.

1. Fairuz sings of utopia in “Al-Quds al-atiqa” no less than Naomi Shemer does in her “Yerushalayim shel zahav” (“Jerusalem of Gold”), which you will remember from the final scene of Stephen Spielberg's *Schindler's List*.
2. To begin our journey along the links among Mediterranean cities, there would be no shortage of songs that make Jerusalem the goal of the earthly journey toward the sacred, toward the past and future of the Abrahamic faiths.
3. Fairuz's song, “Al-Quds al-Atiqa” (“Old Jerusalem”), too, is a song charted by movement, but it is the very path of that movement that makes it an unusual, even disturbing, choice for an initial audio example.

4. Movement, understood as pilgrimage or migrant labor, is intertextual.
 - a. The great Lebanese singer, Fairuz, takes us through the streets of Jerusalem, and there the traces of Jewish diaspora and Palestinian exile form an urban, oral counterpoint.

Verse 1

I passed through the streets
The streets of Old Jerusalem
In front of the shops
The remainder of Palestine

Close of final verse

The streets of Old Jerusalem
Let the songs become rumbling storms
O my voice, continue to stir up a hurricane with these consciences
Their news happened to me
In order to enlighten the conscience

- B. It is the sense of movement itself that transforms Fairuz's song, and so many other songs about Jerusalem, into texts about utopia.
 1. These songs claim Jerusalem from afar, from diaspora and exile, and they portray its reality as transitory.
 2. The Jerusalem of the pilgrim's song mobilizes the faithful to journey to Jerusalem.
 3. The utopia at the end of the journey juxtaposes old and new, even as the lived-in Jerusalem of the twenty-first century remains divided between the Old and the New.
 4. It is through the juxtaposition of old and new that Jerusalem acquires its timelessness, its symbolic presence as the city that has yet to be reached.
- C. The utopian city of the Mediterranean thus possesses the attributes of a shrine or a pilgrimage site.
 1. It remains an earthly city, and the journey the faithful undertake to reach it

- has no terminus on this earth.
- 2. The movement mobilized by song pushes the utopian city into the future.
- 3. It is this quality of historical mobility that comes to characterize the other cities filled with shrines and pilgrimage sites.
 - a. It is the dense presence – and mobility – of such shrines and pilgrimage routes that leads us also to draw Taipei into the considerations of my talk today.

III. *Civitas dei* – Claiming the Cosmos for the Earthly City.

❖ Audio Example 2 (Ppt 5 &6) – Überraschung: “Reise nach Jerusalem” at the 1999 Eurovision Song Contest ❖

- A. The creation of utopia arises from the recognition of the need for difference, the distinction between self and other.
 - 1. In his *City of God*, written over a period of many years beginning in 413 CE, St. Augustine calls for two, not one, two kinds of utopian city.
 - 2. Whereas the divisions between the two cities are sharp – one is the city of God, the other of the self, in other words, the human made of flesh – St. Augustine recognizes the critical importance of both cities.
 - 3. St. Augustine posits a sort of coexistence, if not codependency, for the two cities, in which the self, constituted of flesh and soul, must also reconcile a theological and metaphysical difference vis-à-vis God.

- B. Thinking expansively about the vast literature spawned by utopian writing, particularly that which assumes the engagement with modernity that was already fundamental to Thomas More in his 1516 *Utopia*, Fredric Jameson regards the fissure opened by radical difference as the space of politics and action.

Utopian form is itself a representational meditation on radical difference, radical otherness, and on the systemic nature of the social totality. . . . The fundamental dynamic of any Utopian politics (or of any political Utopianism) will therefore always lie in the [Hegelian] dialectic of Identity and Difference. (Jameson 2005: xii)

C. For the early utopian thinkers, it was *civitas dei* that provided the ultimate city formed from difference, the city of the soul, which could spiritually embody God.

1. The theological dimensions of the *civitas dei* remain particularly powerful in the shaping and reshaping of Mediterranean utopias.
2. Rendered theologically, utopia therefore opens its city gates to difference, those human beings formed of flesh who approach the city to worship at its shrines or to pass through as pilgrims.
3. In search of both self and difference in the city of God, those who journey to the city unleash a new cosmopolitanism, in which the forms of utopia slip into the deceptively homologous forms of dystopia.
4. How different the dystopian view of and from Jerusalem is in the next example, from a different, that is, pre-Intifada, Eurovision Song Contest from Sürpriz's "Journey to Jerusalem," which we viewed moments ago.

❖ PPT 7 & 8 – Teapacks, "Push the Bottom," Israeli ESC entry, 2007 ❖

IV. Dystopia – Memory and the City.

A. If one reaches the utopian city only by traveling into the future, the dystopian city, by contrast, requires that one journey to the past.

1. Notwithstanding the need to journey in different directions, utopia and dystopia are equally unreachable,
2. Hope and nostalgia intersect, transforming the city into an urban space realized only through an archeological reconnoitering of what was and what will be.
3. The dystopian past – of Istanbul, Beirut, or Lisbon – is not so much the memory of a time and place destroyed by history, as it is the imagination of what might have been, were one able to reinhabit the past.

❖ PPT 9 – Sezen Aksu: "Istanbul Memories" ❖

B. The dystopian past of Mediterranean metropolises colors their present in sepia tones,

witnessed so clearly in Sezen Aksu's lyrical evocation of "Istanbul Memories," with which I accelerated the shift from utopia to dystopia using Fatih Akin's 2005 film, *Crossing the Bridge*.

1. The evocation of dystopia appears in many shades of aesthetic sepia.
2. For Orhan Pamuk, throughout his writings, but particularly in his work on Istanbul, the shadings of dystopia radiate from *hüzün*, the pervasive melancholy of Istanbul's residents.
3. Writing of *hüzün* in music and thereby assigning it dystopian overtones, Pamuk writes in his memoirs:

Hüzün . . . is not a feeling that belongs to the outside observer. To varying degrees, classical Ottoman music, Turkish popular music, especially *arabesque* that became popular during the 1980s, are all expressions of this emotion, which we feel as something between physical pain and grief. (Pamuk 2005: 103)

C. In my tracings of the links among global metropolises I may follow a path toward an understanding of dystopia quite different from common attempts to pair it with utopia.

1. The issue that is for me crucial is not that the dystopian city cannot function, that it falls into destruction, but rather that its pasts are reimagined as spaces where life and survival insist on their own viability.
2. Venice, therefore, possesses much of the same will to survive that characterizes the dystopian cosmopolitanism of the Mediterranean.
3. Historically, movement and migration have transformed Venice into an *entrepôt*, another urban metaphor for transforming the space of interaction, exchange, and consumption.
4. It is as an *entrepôt*, indeed, that Venice must yield her insularity, so that she must forego the potential to become a utopian island.

D. Venice's Jewish history – the history of the *ghetto* – unfolds as a response to the city's capacity to make survival possible.

1. There is perhaps no more global symbol of urban dystopia in modern Jewish history than the local, in other words, the *ghetto*, the Venetian district in which the iron foundries preceded the arrival of Jews from throughout Europe and

- the Mediterranean, above all in the wake of the *reconquista*.
2. How remarkably the ghetto functions as a symbol of Jewish dystopia and cosmopolitanism, and it does so because of the urban networks that remapped Jewish history on modernity.
 3. The ghetto provides the modern counterpart to Jerusalem, spreading metaphorically from Venice with the Age of Discovery and the globalization of the Jewish diaspora.
 4. A vast literature and an equally vast music arose from the ghetto, yielding the images of nostalgia and melancholy that shape Jewish music in modernity.
 5. The dystopian city provides the backdrop for folk song, cabaret, and Yiddish film, scripting journeys beyond the ghetto to the New World and preparing for the return to the world of the biblical past.
 6. In the early twentieth century, even Theodor Herzl, in the name of Zionism, would issue a call for the building of a modern ghetto.

V. *Entrepôt* – The City as Site of Consumption and Nostalgia for the Past.

❖ PPt 10 & 11 – Fairuz: “Li-Beirut” ❖

- A. If nostalgia retains some measure of hope that the wounds of a city’s past might be healed, it also recognizes the injury rendered by the past, an injury lingering and irreparable in the present.
 1. We witness such injury repeatedly in one of the most insistently cosmopolitan cities of the Mediterranean, Beirut.
 2. Beirut’s cosmopolitanism is evident in the material foundations of its neighborhoods and its ethnic and religious diversity.
 3. Tested by war and violence seemingly without cessation, Beirut’s cosmopolitanism yields a musical language steeped in the narratives of survival.
 4. The narratives may well gather fragments from a destroyed world, but through song they cohere in dystopian wholeness, announcing themselves as the place that once was and still must be.

Glory from the ashes to Beirut
My city has turned out her lamp
From the blood of a child carried upon her hand
She shut her door, and became alone in the sky
Alone with the night
You are mine, you are mine
Ah, embrace me, you are mine.

B. In the love song she addresses to her dystopian Beirut, Fairuz attributes the qualities of human frailty to the city.

1. The song unfolds as a history of “covers,” of changing sameness.
 - a. You recognize, of course, that it covers Joaquín Rodrigo’s *Concierto de Aranjuez* (1939).
 - b. It also circulates through oral traditions, well known from the *fado* version sung by Amália Rodrigues, and sampled and mixed by Miles Davis and Gil Evans for jazz improvisation.
 - c. Together, these versions form a process of musical movement that can only be utopian through the fragility of a song that settles on places disturbed by the force of history on human inhabitants.
2. How different that humanness is from the similar presence of human inhabitants in the utopian city.
3. In Fairuz’s Beirut, the life of the city is fragile, flawed by its mixing of metaphors.
4. In the utopian city, whether Augustine’s or More’s, or for that matter Huxley’s or Herzl’s, the mixing of biological metaphors would encumber the efficiency of the city as a smoothly-running machine.
5. The destruction of the dystopia could never, in this sense, be confused with the struggle to achieve the utopia that powers the narratives of science fiction, the most common genre of utopian literature (Jameson 2005).
6. Despite its many imperfections, the journey to dystopia depends on the need to nurture and to heal, to turn to the past in order to make it better.

VII. Heterotopia – The City as Cosmos of Difference.

❖ PPT 12 – Outlandish: “Aisha” ❖

- A. If the utopian city is a site of radical difference, as I suggested a moment ago, following Fredric Jameson, then the heterotopian city might well be considered the site of normative difference.
1. Difference – ethnic, religious, political, and musical – generally accompanies discussions of cosmopolitanism.
 2. The gift of the cosmopolitan, according to Anthony Appiah (2006), is the ability to accommodate difference.
 3. We might extend this argument, then, by suggesting that the formation of heterotopia results in deradicalizing difference, creating what I shall call, in conclusion, a “post-migrant musical vernacular.”
 4. This is the language, moreover, of what I’ll also call a “post-secular Europe.”
- B. It is with the rise of heterotopian cosmopolitanism in the Mediterranean that movement and migration, too, become normative.
1. Heterotopia is by its very nature transient.
 2. Cities adopt the attributes of heterotopia only to shed them again, when the conditions that favored them no longer contribute to civic culture.
 3. The heterotopian mix endows the city with new forms of self-imagination and self-celebration, but in order to do so, it requires that the city turn outward.
 4. The heterotopian public sphere, however, may also lie between two equally unattainable ideals.
 5. It is that in-betweenness of the heterotopia that we find straddling the space between Augustine’s two cities.
 6. For Augustine such in-betweenness is the space of most extensive cosmopolitanism.
- C. I shall briefly turn to two cases that reveal different relations to European heterotopia: the Eurovision City and the *banlieu* populated extensively by Mediterranean migrants.
1. In both case, movement and migration are extreme, so extreme in fact that

- we might pose the question, What is European about these cities?
2. The real question that concerns me is the way in which the Mediterranean has historically problematized the idea of Europe and city music for the Eurovision Song Contest.
 - a. The two Israeli European entries that we saw earlier could not have made the utopian-dystopian fissure clearer and more disturbing.
 3. From the initial influences of the San Remo Festival on the Eurovision to the politics of national competition in Southeastern Europe and the Eastern Mediterranean, the Mediterranean's contribution to the "song for Europe" has born witness to the need to level difference, to appeal, that is, for acceptance of a growing number of nations within the spectacle of the European Broadcasting Union, forty-three this year.
 4. We have witnessed this deradicalized difference already in the performance of the Turkish-German ensemble, Sürpriz, at the 1999 Eurovision in Jerusalem.
 5. Sürpriz's mixture of languages and appeal to religious and political tolerance were notable only because they emerged from a cultural mix that embraced all of Europe, but was not embraced by Europe.
 6. One could not say the same about Israel's polyglot entry in 2007, Teapack's "Push the Button," which insisted on displaying radical difference.
 7. The new heterotopia, I believe, is evident in the increasing number of national languages in the Eurovision entries, which signal difference in what seems to many a festival of sameness.

VIII. *Banlieu* – The Vernacular of a New Mediterranean.

❖ PPT 13 – Khaled, Taha, Faudel (3 Soleils): "Aisha" ❖

- A. It is with the *banlieu* that I provide the counterpart to the heterotopian city and draw us toward the conclusion of my presentation today.
 1. By stretching city spaces to the suburbs, I also follow the routes of migrant musicians to different sites.
 2. I divert the flow of musics from the Mediterranean littoral to the littoral of the

postmodern and, I might suggest, post-ethnic and post-migrant Europe.

3. The two audio examples I have chosen to evoke the soundscape of the heterotopian city, in fact, draw us to the *banlieux* of two European cities, Paris and Copenhagen, both Mediterranean only because of the networks that connect them to North Africa.
4. The two examples, both versions of Khaled's "Aïcha," reveal a complex movement of music with migrants and the figurative covering of music to chart that movement.
5. Both Khaled and Outlandish, a mixed-ethnic, Muslim band from the western districts of Copenhagen, perform a music that resonates at the cosmopolitan peripheries, where the music of the Mediterranean forms a new vernacular.

B. The heterotopian city asks us to think about the possibility of a post-ethnic Europe, in which migrants and migrant musics have found a sort of "naturalized" presence, fully capable of embracing Khaled's Maghrebi-Arabic-inflected *raï* as their own.

1. We witness here what I'd like to call the "vernacular of post-ethnic Europe."
2. In literature, this is the prose style that we find in Emine Sevgi Özdamar's *Mutterzunge* (1990), Gautam Malkani's *Londonstani* (2006) or Faïza Guène's *Kiffe kiffe demain* (2004).
3. In music, this is the mix we hear so clearly in Outlandish's rapping.
4. We might ask ourselves whether these vernaculars have historically begun to extend a Mediterranean aesthetic similar to that of the African diaspora.

B. The post-ethnic vernacular is both local and modern – "native" to a postmodern moment that is very local and temporally bounded.

1. Without modern media – e-mail and text-message spellings in *Londonstani*, for instance, or sampling from public media as in Arabic rap in the Parisian *banlieu* – the vernacular could not come into existence.
 - a. It is local practice, fluid, constantly in motion.
2. This vernacular is also different from an earlier generation of writing and music making.
 - a. It is a type of bilingualism as opposed to a multilingualism.
 - b. It is the language of the first-generation immigrant rather than the

second-generation ethnic group.

C. The question we might now want to consider as we turn to discussion at the close of my presentation is whether music facilitates the formation and dissemination of this vernacular of heterotopian cosmopolitanism in Europe offers ways to think in different ways, some of the radical, about the city in Taiwan and Asia.

1. Obviously, I think it does, but what might I mean – about music, or about Buddhism, Christianity, and indigenous sacred practice in Taiwan – when I suggest that it does?
2. First of all, I want to point out the role of music as medium and communication.
 - a. The question no longer derives from the usual ontological-aesthetic ambivalence about music in world religions.
3. Second, vernacular forms of expression localize rather than globalize.
 - a. Outlandish's rapping becomes about Copenhagen, just as it relocates Islamic experience from North Africa to modernity and Copenhagen.
4. Third, the heterotopian vernacular enters a type of neo-oral tradition, which is spoken and perceived by a generation it draws together.
 - a. The common experiences of Gautami's rap-like prose or Guène's raï-like prose and Outlandish's rapping lyrics belongs to the suburbs – Hounslow, the banlieu, and "Copenhagen's west suburbs."
 - b. These are the musical spaces of a postmodern Mediterranean cosmopolitanism in Europe.

IX. The Metropole and Utopian Musics in the Mediterranean.

A. During his Italian journey of 1786-1788, Goethe sojourned in Venice, captivated in the city by the very nature of its song, that is, by *Gesang*.

1. When writing about Venetian song in his Italian diaries, Goethe speculates about the ways in which the place and space of Venetian song were transitory, and that the generous supply of singers who moved through the streets and along the canals constantly redefined the spaces of the city.
2. Goethe himself insisted on assuming a space for listening that included multiple singers, separated from him at various distances and in various

directions.

Song in Venice is that which one experiences in a loneliness formed from great distances, but which allows one to hear someone else from afar, whose voice is the same, and then to speak back to him. (Johann Wolfgang von Goethe; diary entry for 6 October 1786; cited in Gretter 1997)

B. It is not only the place of music that I examine in my remarks today, but also the place of the city and the mobility of music and musicians migrating to the city.

1. I turn to music and migration, as we do all week, to think about the place of place itself.
2. We concern ourselves with movement and migration on so many different levels.
3. We also turn to music as the place of music itself, narrating the Mediterranean in its utopian imagination, dystopian nostalgia, and its heterotopian reality.
4. As I myself move between these forms of the Mediterranean city, which I had meant to engender new ways of understanding city music and the making of modern Europe, I realize that I have, perhaps, distanced myself from the sources of sound, if in the sense conveyed by Goethe.
4. Sources themselves seem rather more than less mixed up, not least among them the etymological sources for the cosmopolitan.

C. In search of the music moving through the spaces of modernity, be it in our studies of migration and revival, or Eurovision songs, we might ask ourselves, do we actually steer a course of in-betweenness, keeping our distances, as did Goethe, but recognizing the transitoriness of utopia, Thomas More's "no place," or of heterotopia, the "place of difference" in our own age?

1. Born by its music the Mediterranean enters the city in new and different ways, transforming a world that depends on the convergence of utopia and dystopia.