

「佛教不可言說之語言哲學」課程大綱

課程名稱：佛教不可言說之語言哲學 Buddhist Philosophy of Ineffability

授課教師：蔡耀明

學分數：3學分

授課年度：一〇三學年度第一學期

上課時間：星期五 (13:20-16:20)

教室：哲學系三樓研討室一

Office hours: 星期二 (2:20-3:10), 星期三 (11:20-12:10), 星期五 (4:30-5:20), @
台大水源校區哲學系館515 (台北市思源街18號。)

電子信箱：tsaiyt@ntu.edu.tw

網站：<http://ccms.ntu.edu.tw/~tsaiyt/>

【課程概述】

本課程將探討佛教語言哲學的一個重大主張：世界關聯的項目之確實的情形是不可言說的，亦即，不等同於用以指稱的語詞，不被言說所捕捉，以及並非以語詞區分的方式而彼此區隔而存在。此一重大主張，涉及確實的情形與語詞之間的落差、語言的限度、如何善用語言以指向確實的情形、以及如何善用語言以開發智慧與前往解脫之目標。

【課程目標】

本課程的目標，在於對佛教不可言說之語言哲學的課題，建立以典籍和學術論文做為依據的思辨與認識，並且奠定從事佛教哲學或語言哲學專門研究的基礎。以條列的方式，透過本課程的歷練，學員可預期達到如下四項成果：(1) 對佛教不可言說之語言哲學的研究領域、課題、方法、和內容，形成一定水準的認識；(2) 對學界在佛教不可言說之語言哲學的研究書目與研究成果有一定水準的認識；(3) 憑藉學養，得以入乎佛教不可言說之語言哲學的眼光、思辨、和觀點，並且出乎其外；(4) 初步建立以第一手和第二手資料來從事佛教不可言說之語言哲學的研究能力，強化獨特的哲學思考，並且提昇學習報告的寫作水平。

【課程要求】

本課程設定為研究所層級的專題討論課，並非大學部一般的導論或通論課。學員必須預先研讀本課程大綱所列的主要的課程材料，在課堂上積極參與討論，以及按時完成學期作業。每一進度單元所列的「延伸的參考材料」，多少皆具參考價值；若是碩士班研究生，並不硬性規定必讀；若是博士班研究生，則要求藉此量力或盡力拓展課程修讀的廣度、深度、和層級。

【參考書目】

詳如「課程進度」所列。要求閱讀以及在課堂予以講解和討論者，以粗體字標示。更多的參考材料，於課堂隨時補充。

【評量方式】：平時上課 70%、期末作業 30%。

【課程進度】

第1週2014/09/19〔單元主題〕：

* 《中部10·念住經》(MN 10: *Satipaṭṭhāna-sutta*)。

* 蔡耀明,〈〈迦旃延氏經〉(*Kātyāyana-sūtra*)梵漢對勘及其不二中道學理〉。
〔延伸的參考材料〕

* 蔡耀明,〈《阿含經》和《說無垢稱經》的不二法門初探〉,《佛學研究中心學報》第7期(2002年7月),頁1-26.

第2週2014/09/26〔單元主題〕：

* Yao-ming Tsai, “Language As an Instrument of Soteriological Transformation from the Madhyamaka Perspective,” presented at the 2014 International Conference on Buddhist Thought: Language in the Traditions of Madhyamaka Thought, held by Graduate Institute of Asian Humanities at Huaan University, Taiwan, June 27-29, 2014, 22 pages.

* 蔡耀明,〈「不二中道」學說相關導航概念的詮釋進路：以佛法解開生命世界的全面實相在思惟的導引為詮釋線索〉,《臺灣大學哲學論評》第32期(2006年10月),頁115-166.

* 蔡耀明,〈《入楞伽經》的心身不二的實相學說：從排除障礙的一面著手〉,《法鼓佛學學報》第6期(2010年6月),頁57-114.

* 蔡耀明,〈論「有無」並非適任的形上學概念：以《密嚴經》和《入楞伽經》為主要依據〉,《正觀》第50期(2009年9月),頁65-103.

〔延伸的參考材料〕

* 蔡耀明,〈觀看做為導向生命出路的修行界面：以《大般若經·第九會·能斷金剛分》為主要依據的哲學探究〉,《圓光佛學學報》第13期(2008年6月),頁23-69.

* 蔡耀明,〈《佛說不增不減經》「眾生界不增不減」的修學義理：由眾生界、法界、法身到如來藏的理路開展〉,《臺灣大學哲學論評》第28期(2004年10月),頁89-155.

* Yao-ming Tsai, “Perspectives on the Person and the Self in Vasubandhu’s *Abhidharma-kośa-bhāṣya*,” presented at the conference From Abhidhamma to Abhidharma: Early Buddhist Scholasticism in India, Central-Asia, and China, in Ghent, Belgium, held by the Ghent Centre for Buddhist Studies of Ghent University, July 8-9, 2013, 17 pages.

* Yao-ming Tsai, “How Does an Empty Buddhist Bioethics Work: The Example of Abortion,” in the *Proceedings of 4th International Conference on Applied Ethics and Applied Philosophy in East Asia*, Kobe: Project Innovative Ethics, Graduate School of Humanities, Kobe University, 2014, pp. 148-159.

第3週2014/10/03〔單元主題〕：

* Karen Lang, “Candrakīrti on the Limits of Language and Logic,” *A Companion to Buddhist Philosophy*, edited by Steven Emmanuel, Malden: Wiley-Blackwell, 2013, pp. 331-348.

〔延伸的參考材料〕

- * Johannes Bronkhorst, *Language and Reality: On an Episode in Indian Thought*, Boston: Brill, 2011.
- * Brendan Gillon, "Language and Logic in Indian Buddhist Thought," *A Companion to Buddhist Philosophy*, edited by Steven Emmanuel, Malden: Wiley-Blackwell, 2013, pp. 307-319.
- * Raghunath Ghosh, Jyotish Basak (eds.), *Language and Truth in Buddhism*, New Delhi: Northern Book Centre, 2009.
- * Steven Heine, "On the Value of Speaking and Not Speaking: Philosophy of Language in Zen Buddhism," *A Companion to Buddhist Philosophy*, edited by Steven Emmanuel, Malden: Wiley-Blackwell, 2013, pp. 349-365.
- * Richard Nance, "The Voice of Another: Speech, Responsiveness, and Buddhist Philosophy," *A Companion to Buddhist Philosophy*, edited by Steven Emmanuel, Malden: Wiley-Blackwell, 2013, pp. 366-376.

第4週2014/10/10〔單元主題〕：國慶日

第5週2014/10/17〔單元主題〕：調課

* **Graham Priest, "Two Truths: Two Models," *Moonshadows: Conventional Truth in Buddhist Philosophy*, edited by the Cowherds, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2011, pp. 213-220.**

〔延伸的參考材料〕

* Graham Priest and et al., "The (Two) Truths about Truth," *Moonshadows: Conventional Truth in Buddhist Philosophy*, edited by the Cowherds, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2011, pp. 131-150.

第6週2014/10/24〔單元主題〕：

* **Jay Garfield, Graham Priest, "Nāgārjuna and the Limits of Thought," *Philosophy East & West* 53, Number /1 (January 2003): 1-21.**

* **Jay Garfield, "Chapter 9: Sounds of Silence: Ineffability and the Limits of Language in Madhyamaka and Yogācāra," *Empty Words: Buddhist Philosophy and Cross-Cultural Interpretation*, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2002, pp. 170-183, 280.**

〔延伸的參考材料〕

* José Cabezón, "Chapter 9: Ineffability and the Silence of the Buddha," *Buddhism and Language: A Study of Indo-Tibetan Scholasticism*, Albany: State University of New York, 1994, pp. 171-187, 258-261.

* David Cooper, "Emptiness: Interpretation and Metaphor," *Contemporary Buddhism* 3/1 (2002): 7-20.

* Luis Gómez, "Measuring the Immeasurable: Reflection on Unreasonable Reasoning," in *Buddhist Theology: Critical Reflections by Contemporary Buddhist Scholars*, edited by Roger Jackson, John Makransky, Richmond: Curzon Press, 1999, pp. 367-385.

* Donald Lopez, Jr., "What Can One Reasonably Say about Nonexistence?" in Tom Tillemans,

Scripture, Logic, Language: Essays on Dharmakīrti and his Tibetan Successors, Boston: Wisdom, 1999, 247-284.

* Kwangsoo Park, "An Analysis of the Buddha's Paradoxical Silence: Neither the Positive nor Nihilistic View," *International Journal of Buddhist Thought & Culture* 6 (February 2006): 243-264.

第7週2014/10/31〔單元主題〕：

* **André Kukla, "Ineffability: The Very Idea," *Ineffability and Philosophy*, London: Routledge, 2005, pp. 1-51.**

〔延伸的參考材料〕

* Ben-Ami Scharfstein, *Ineffability: The Failure of Words in Philosophy and Religion*, Albany: State University of New York Press, 1993.

A. W. Moore, "Ineffability and Religion," *European Journal of Philosophy* 11/2 (July 2003): 161-176.

* Jan Zwicky, "What Is Ineffable?" *International Studies in the Philosophy of Science* 26/2 (June 2012): 197-217.

第8週2014/11/07〔單元主題〕：

* **André Kukla, "Ineffability: The Very Idea," *Ineffability and Philosophy*, London: Routledge, 2005, pp. 1-51.**

* **Douglas Duckworth, "De/limiting Emptiness and the Boundaries of the Ineffable," *Journal of Indian Philosophy* 38/1 (February 2010): 97-105.**

〔延伸的參考材料〕

* Tiziana Pontillo, Maria Candotti (eds.), *Signless Signification in Ancient India and Beyond*, London: Anthem, 2013.

* Asanga Tilakaratne, *Nirvana and Ineffability: A Study of the Buddhist Theory of Reality and Language*, Colombo: Postgraduate Institute of Pali and Buddhist Studies, University of Kelaniya, 1993.

第9週2014/11/14〔單元主題〕：

* **Mario D'Amato, "Buddhism, Apophasis, Truth," *Journal for Cultural and Religious Theory* 9/2 (Summer 2008): 17-29.**

〔延伸的參考材料〕

* Mario D'Amato, "Why the Buddha Never Uttered a Word," *Pointing at the Moon: Buddhism, Logic, Analytic Philosophy*, edited by Mario D'Amato and et al., Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2009, pp. 41-55.

* Robert Gimello, "Apophasic and Kataphatic Discourse in Mahāyāna: A Chinese View," *Philosophy East and West* 26/2 (April 1976): 117-136.

* Lawrence McCrea, Parimal Patil, *Buddhist Philosophy of Language in India: Jñānaśrīmitra's Monograph on Exclusion*, New York: Columbia University Press, 2010.

第10週2014/11/21〔單元主題〕：

* 《解深密經 (*Samdhi-nirmocana-sūtra*) · 勝義諦相品第二》，唐·玄奘譯，
T. 676, vol. 16, pp. 688c-692a.

* John Powers (tr.), “Chapter Two: The Questions of Dharmodgata,” *Wisdom of Buddha: The Samdhinirmocana Mahāyāna Sūtra*, Berkeley: Dharma Publishing, 1995, pp. 23-31.

〔《解深密經》的相關傳譯本〕

* 《深密解脫經》，五卷，元魏·菩提流支譯，T. 675, vol. 16, pp. 665b-688a.

* 《佛說解節經》，一卷，陳·真諦譯，T. 677, vol. 16, pp. 711b-714c.

* 《相續解脫地波羅蜜了義經》，一卷，劉宋·求那跋陀羅譯，T. 678, vol. 16, pp. 714c-718a.

* 《相續解脫如來所作隨順處了義經》，一卷，劉宋·求那跋陀羅譯，T. 679, vol. 16, pp. 718a-720b.

第11週2014/11/28〔單元主題〕：

* 《大般若波羅蜜多經 (*Prajñāpāramitā-sūtra*) · 第二會·真如品第五十二》，
唐·玄奘譯，T. 220 (2), vol. 7, pp. 251c-260b.

* Edward Conze (tr.), “Chapter 48: Settlement in the Training of a Bodhisattva,” *The Large Sutra on Perfect Wisdom with the Divisions of the Abhisamayālaṅkāra*, Berkeley: University of California Press, 1975, pp. 376-387.

第12週2014/12/05〔單元主題〕：

* 《大般若波羅蜜多經 (*Prajñāpāramitā-sūtra*) · 第二會·實說品第八十四》，
唐·玄奘譯，T. 220 (2), vol. 7, pp. 422a-425b.

* Edward Conze (tr.), “Chapter 81: Being Joined to Ultimate Reality,” *The Large Sutra on Perfect Wisdom with the Divisions of the Abhisamayālaṅkāra*, Berkeley: University of California Press, 1975, pp. 636-641.

第13週2014/12/12〔單元主題〕：

* 《大方等大集經 (*Mahā-vaipulya-mahā-sannipāta-sūtra*) · 不可說菩薩品
第七》，北涼·曇無讖 (*Dharmakṣema*) 譯，T. 397, vol. 13, pp. 83c-92c.

第14週2014/12/19〔單元主題〕：

* 《大方廣佛華嚴經 (*Avataṃsaka-sūtra*) · 心王菩薩問阿僧祇品第二十五》，
東晉·佛跋陀羅 (*Buddhabhadra*) 譯，T. 278, vol. 9, pp. 586a-589b.

第15週2014/12/26〔單元主題〕：

* 《大般若波羅蜜多經 (*Prajñāpāramitā-sūtra*) · 第十六會·般若波羅蜜多
分》，唐·玄奘譯，T. 220 (16), vol. 7, pp. 1065c-1110b.

〔延伸的參考材料〕

* Ryusho Hikata (ed.), *Suvikrāntavikrāmi-pariprcchā prajñāpāramitā sūtra* 《梵文善勇猛般若波羅蜜多經·序論文付》, Fukuoka: Kyushu University, 1958.

* Edward Conze (tr.), “The Questions of Suvikrāntavikrāmin,” *Perfect Wisdom: The Short Prajñāpāramitā Texts*, translated by Totnes: Buddhist Publishing Group, 1993, pp. 1-78.

第16週2015/01/02〔單元主題〕：

* 《大般若波羅蜜多經 (*Prajñāpāramitā-sūtra*) · 第十六會 · 般若波羅蜜多分》，唐·玄奘譯，T. 220 (16), vol. 7, pp. 1065c-1110b.

第17週2015/01/09〔單元主題〕：

* 《大般若波羅蜜多經 (*Prajñāpāramitā-sūtra*) · 第十六會 · 般若波羅蜜多分》，唐·玄奘譯，T. 220 (16), vol. 7, pp. 1065c-1110b.

第18週2015/01/16〔單元主題〕：期末報告