

「佛教語言哲學」課程大綱

課程名稱：佛教語言哲學 Buddhist Philosophy of Language

授課教師：蔡耀明

學分數：3學分

授課年度：一〇〇學年度第二學期

上課時間：星期五 (13:20-16:20)

教室：哲學系研討室一

Office hours: 星期二 (1:20-3:10), 星期五 (1:20-2:10), @台大水源校區哲學系館 512 (台北市思源街18號。)

電子信箱：tsaiyt@ntu.edu.tw

網站：<http://ccms.ntu.edu.tw/tsaiyt/>

【課程概述】

本課程將探討佛教語言哲學的幾個重大的論題，包括「意義」與「真理」之意義，語言與世界之關係，語言如何表達信念、心態、或知識，聯繫動詞的失誤，實相之可說或不可說，藉以奠定佛教哲學或宗教哲學必備的研究素養。列為課程提綱的單元項目，包括：佛教語言哲學之背景知識與研究要領／佛教語言哲學研究書目或評介／基本概念的界說和釐清／重大論題的提出／語詞之形而上的(實相上的)局限式論斷與跨界式論斷／語詞用於學說／實相之智慧的意義遠離語詞言說／名稱／標名／空性而幻化變現之假名觀／語言之生性／語言與真理／沈默之教說／說而不說／不可被言說捕捉到 (incapability of being expressed in words/ 不可說)／否定詞的超脫單一概念／否定詞的超脫二邊概念／假藉語詞如同船筏的隨宜教說／隨言取義之弊病及其排除／極致意義之彰顯／約定俗成之真實與極致意義之真實／雖作是說而不如說／超過一切名言道／密咒與陀羅尼之語意、作用、與生性／陀羅尼門／般若波羅蜜多為廣大之密咒／語言、矛盾、符應對象、實相／心識運作與言說／離言法性／感覺、推論、語言／解構語言。

【課程目標】

本課程的目標，在於對佛教語言哲學之課題，建立以典籍和學術論文做為依據的思辨與認識，並且奠定從事佛教哲學或宗教哲學專門研究的基礎。以條列的方式，透過本課程的歷練，學員可預期達到如下四項成果：(1) 對佛教語言哲學的研究領域、課題、方法、和內容，形成一定水準的認識；(2) 對學界在佛教語言哲學的研究書目與研究成果有一定水準的認識；(3) 憑藉學養，得以入乎佛教語言哲學之課題的眼光、思辨、和觀點，並且出乎其外；(4) 初步建立以第一手和第二手資料來從事佛教語言哲學之課題的研究的能力，強化獨特的哲學思考，並且提昇學習報告的寫作水平。

【課程要求】

本課程定位為研究所層級的專題討論課，並非大學部一般的導論或通論課。學員必須預先研讀本課程大綱所列的主要的課程材料，在課堂上積極參與討論，以及

按時完成學期作業。每一進度單元所列的「延伸的參考材料」，多少皆具參考價值；若是碩士班研究生，並不硬性規定必讀；若是博士班研究生，則要求藉此量力或盡力拓展課程修讀的廣度、深度、和層級。

【教材及參考書目】

詳如「課程進度」所列。要求閱讀以及在課堂予以講解和討論者，以粗體字標示。更多的參考材料，於課堂隨時補充。

【成績評量方式】平時上課 50%、期末報告 50%。

【課程進度】

第 1 週 2012/02/24〔單元主題〕：課程介紹／佛教語言哲學之背景知識與研究要領／佛教語言哲學研究書目或評介／基本概念的界說和釐清／重大論題的提出

* 蔡耀明，〈「不二中道」學說相關導航概念的詮釋進路：以佛法解開生命世界的全面實相在思惟的導引為詮釋線索〉，《臺灣大學哲學論評》第 32 期（2006 年 10 月），頁 115-166。

* V. Zegarac, “Language as an Object of Study,” *Concise Encyclopedia of Philosophy of Language and Linguistics*, edited by Alex Barber and Robert Stainton, Oxford: Elsevier, 2010, pp. 345-348.

* I. Onians, “Buddhism and Language,” *Concise Encyclopedia of Language and Religion*, edited by J.F.A. Sawyer and J.M.Y. Simpson, Amsterdam: Elsevier, 2001, pp. 288-290.

〔語言哲學——延伸的參考材料〕

* Alex Barber, Robert Stainton (eds.), *Concise Encyclopedia of Philosophy of Language and Linguistics*, Oxford: Elsevier, 2010.

* Siobhan Chapman, Christopher Routledge (eds.), *Key Ideas in Linguistics and the Philosophy of Language*, Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2009.

* Hayley Davis, Talbot Taylor (eds.), *Rethinking Linguistics*, London: RoutledgeCurzon, 2003.

* Michael Devitt, Richard Hanley (eds.), *The Blackwell Guide to the Philosophy of Language*, Malden: Blackwell, 2006.

* John Hawthorne (ed.), *Philosophy of Language*, Malden: Wiley Periodicals, 2008.

* William Lycan, *Philosophy of Language: A Contemporary Introduction*, 2nd ed., New York: Routledge, 2008.

* A.P. Martinich (ed.), *Philosophy of Language: Critical Concepts in Philosophy*, London: Routledge, 2009.

* Susana Nuccetelli, Gary Seay (eds.), *Philosophy of Language: The Central Topics*, Lanham: Rowman & Littlefield, 2008.

* Sarah Sawyer (ed.), *New Waves in Philosophy of Language*, Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2010.

* Robert Stainton, *Words and Thoughts: Subsentences, Ellipsis, and the Philosophy of Language*, Oxford: Clarendon, 2006.

* Piotr Stalmaszczyk (ed.), *Philosophy of Language and Linguistics*, Frankfurt: Ontos Verlag, 2010.

* Savas Tsohatzidis (ed.), *John Searle's Philosophy of Language: Force, Meaning and Mind*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007.

〔宗教與語言——延伸的參考材料〕

* Piotr Balcerowicz (ed.), *Logic and Belief in Indian Philosophy*, Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 2010.

* William Downes, *Language and Religion: A Journey into the Human Mind*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2011.

* Nile Green, Mary Searle-Chatterjee (eds.), *Religion, Language, and Power*, New York: Routledge, 2008.

* Patrick McNamara, "Chapter 10: Religious Language," *The Neuroscience of Religious Experience*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2009, pp. 206-211.

* Bimal Matilal, *Logic, Language and Reality: Indian Philosophy and Contemporary Issues*, Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass Publishers, 1985.

* J.F.A. Sawyer, J.M.Y. Simpson (eds.), *Concise Encyclopedia of Language and Religion*, Amsterdam: Elsevier, 2001.

* James Turner, *Language, Religion, Knowledge: Past and Present*, Notre Dame: University of Notre Dame Press, 2003.

* Roger White, *Talking about God: The Concept of Analogy and the Problem of Religious Language*, Farnham: Ashgate, 2010.

〔佛教語言哲學——延伸的參考材料〕

* Johannes Bronkhorst, *Language and Reality: On an Episode in Indian Thought*, Boston: Brill, 2011.

* José Cabezón, *Buddhism and Language: A Study of Indo-Tibetan Scholasticism*, Albany: State University of New York, 1994.

* The Cowherds, *Moonshadows: Conventional Truth in Buddhist Philosophy*, New York: Oxford University Press, 2011.

* Mario D'Amato and et al. (eds.), *Pointing at the Moon: Buddhism, Logic, Analytic Philosophy*, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2009.

* Jay Garfield, *Empty Words: Buddhist Philosophy and Cross-Cultural Interpretation*, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2002.

* Raghunath Ghosh, Jyotish Basak (eds.), *Language and Truth in Buddhism*, New Delhi: Northern Book Centre, 2009.

* Soonil Hwang, *Metaphor And Literalism In Buddhism: The Doctrinal History of Nirvana*, London: Routledge, 2006.

* David Kalupahana, *The Buddha's Philosophy of Language*, Ratmalana: Sarvodaya Vishva Lekha, 1999.

* Bimal Matilal, Robert Evans (eds.), *Buddhist Logic and Epistemology: Studies in the Buddhist Analysis of Inference and Language*, Dordrecht: D. Reidel, 1986.

* Lawrence McCrea, Parimal Patil, *Buddhist Philosophy of Language in India: Jñānaśrīmitra's Monograph on Exclusion*, New York: Columbia University Press, 2010.

* Richard Payne, *Language Conducive to Awakening: Categories of Language Use in East Asian Buddhism -- with a particular attention to Vajrayāna Tradition*, München: Iudicium, 1998.

* Youru Wang, *Linguistic Strategies in Daoist Zhuangzi and Chan Buddhism: The Other Way of Speaking*, London: RoutledgeCurzon, 2003.

* Robert Yelle, *Explaining Mantras: Ritual, Rhetoric, and the Dream of a Natural Language in Hindu Tantra*, New York: Routledge, 2003.

* Przemysław Żywiczyński, *Buddhism and Meaning: Comparative Assessment of Buddhist Views on Cognition, Meaning, and Language*, Toruń: Wydawnictwo Uniwersytetu Mikołaja Kopernika, 2004.

〔語言是什麼——延伸的參考材料〕

* John Searle, “What Is Language?: Some Preliminary Remarks,” *John Searle’s Philosophy of Language: Force, Meaning and Mind*, edited by Savas Tsohatzidis, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007, pp. 15-45.

第2週2012/03/02〔單元主題〕：語詞之形而上的（實相上的）局限式論斷與跨界式論斷／語詞用於學說

* 蔡耀明，〈論「有無」並非適任的形上學概念：以《密嚴經》和《入楞伽經》為主要依據〉，《正觀》第50期（2009年9月），頁65-103。

* José Cabezón, “Chapter 2: The Nature of Doctrine: The Buddha’s Word and Its Transcendence,” “Chapter 10: Conclusion,” *Buddhism and Language: A Study of Indo-Tibetan Scholasticism*, Albany: State University of New York, 1994, pp. 29-52, 189-199, 214-224, 262-263.

〔延伸的參考材料〕

* Karol Janicki, “Chapter 6: The Unfortunate Word Is *Is* of Identity and *Is* of Predication--E Prime,” *Confusing Discourse*, Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2010, pp. 142-170.

第3週2012/03/09〔單元主題〕：實相之智慧的意義遠離語詞言說／名稱／標名
* 《大般若波羅蜜多經（*Prajñāpāramitā-sūtra*）·第二會·帝釋品第二十五》，唐·玄奘譯，大正藏第七冊（T. 220 (2), vol. 7, pp. 138b-139c）。

* J.F.A. Sawyer, “Names: Religious Beliefs,” *Concise Encyclopedia of Language and Religion*, edited by J.F.A. Sawyer and J.M.Y. Simpson, Amsterdam: Elsevier, 2001, pp. 302-304.

* A. P. Cohen, “Naming,” *Concise Encyclopedia of Language and Religion*, edited by J.F.A. Sawyer and J.M.Y. Simpson, Amsterdam: Elsevier, 2001, pp. 304-308.

第4週2012/03/16〔單元主題〕：空性而幻化變現之假名觀／語言之生性／語言與真理

* 《大般若波羅蜜多經（*Prajñāpāramitā-sūtra*）·第二會·散花品第二十七》，唐·玄奘譯，大正藏第七冊（T. 220 (2), vol. 7, pp. 141a-145c）。

* David Kalupahana, “Chapter 6: Nature of Language?” “Chapter 11: Language and Truth,” *The Buddha’s Philosophy of Language*, Ratmalana: Sarvodaya Vishva Lekha, 1999, pp. 48-54, 77-83, 125, 128.

〔延伸的參考材料〕

* José Cabezón, “Chapter 3: Hermeneutics: The Truth and Meaning of Scripture,” *Buddhism and Language: A Study of Indo-Tibetan Scholasticism*, Albany: State University of New York, 1994, pp. 53-70.

第5週2012/03/23〔單元主題〕：沈默之教說／說而不說

* 《大般若波羅蜜多經（*Prajñāpāramitā-sūtra*）·第九會·能斷金剛分》，唐·玄奘譯，大正藏第七冊（T. 220 (9), vol. 7, pp. 980a-985c）。

* 《說無垢稱經·不二法門品第九》，唐·玄奘譯，大正藏第十四冊（T. 476, vol. 14, pp. 577a-578c）。

* M. Saviile-Troike, “Silence,” *Concise Encyclopedia of Language and Religion*, edited by J.F.A. Sawyer and J.M.Y. Simpson, Amsterdam: Elsevier, 2001, pp. 281-283.

〔延伸的參考材料〕

* 蔡耀明，〈《阿含經》和《說無垢稱經》的不二法門初探〉，《佛學研究中心學報》第7期（2002年7月），頁1-26。

* 蔡耀明，〈「確實安住」如何可能置基於「無住」？：以《說無垢稱經》為主要依據的「安住」之哲學探究〉，《正觀》第57期（2011年6月），頁119-168。

第6週2012/03/30〔單元主題〕：說而不說／不可被言說捕捉到（incapability of being expressed in words/ 不可說）

* Mario D’Amato, “Why the Buddha Never Uttered a Word,” *Pointing at the Moon: Buddhism, Logic, Analytic Philosophy*, edited by Mario D’Amato and et al., Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2009, pp. 41-55.

* Jay Garfield, “Chapter 9: Sounds of Silence: Ineffability and the Limits of Language in Madhyamaka and Yogācāra,” *Empty Words: Buddhist Philosophy and Cross-Cultural Interpretation*, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2002, pp. 170-183, 280.

〔延伸的參考材料〕

* José Cabezón, “Chapter 9: Ineffability and the Silence of the Buddha,” *Buddhism and Language: A Study of Indo-Tibetan Scholasticism*, Albany: State University of New York, 1994, pp. 171-187, 258-261.

* David Cooper, “Emptiness: Interpretation and Metaphor,” *Contemporary Buddhism* 3/1 (2002): 7-20.

* Luis Gómez, “Measuring the Immeasurable: Reflection on Unreasonable Reasoning,” in *Buddhist Theology: Critical Reflections by Contemporary Buddhist Scholars*, edited by Roger Jackson, John

Makransky, Richmond: Curzon Press, 1999, pp. 367-385.

* Donald Lopez, Jr., "What Can One Reasonably Say about Nonexistence?," in Tom Tillemans, *Scripture, Logic, Language: Essays on Dharmakīrti and his Tibetan Successors*, Boston: Wisdom, 1999, 247-284.

第 7 週 2012/04/06 [單元主題]：否定詞的超脫單一概念／否定詞的超脫二邊概念／假藉語詞如同船筏的隨宜教說

* 《大般若波羅蜜多經 (*Prajñāpāramitā-sūtra*) · 第九會 · 能斷金剛分》，唐 · 玄奘譯，大正藏第七冊 (T. 220 (9), vol. 7, pp. 980a-985c) 。

* Shigenori Nagatomo, "The Logic of the Diamond Sutra: A is not A, therefore It is A," *Asian Philosophy* 10/3 (2000): 213-244.

[延伸的參考材料]

* 蔡耀明，〈觀看做為導向生命出路的修行界面：以《大般若經 · 第九會 · 能斷金剛分》為主要依據的哲學探究〉，《圓光佛學學報》第 13 期 (2008 年 6 月)，頁 23-69.

* Shigenori Nagatomo, *The Diamondsūtra's Logic of Not and A Critique of Katz's Contextualism: Toward a Non-dualist Philosophy*, Lewiston: Edwin Mellen, 2006, pp. 1-54.

第 8 週 2012/04/13 [單元主題]：隨言取義之弊病及其排除

* 《大乘入楞伽經 (*Laṅkāvatāra-sūtra*)》，七卷，唐 · 實叉難陀 (Śikṣānanda/ 學喜) 譯，(T. 672, vol. 16, pp. 587b-640c) 。

* 蔡耀明，〈《入楞伽經》的心身不二的實相學說：從排除障礙的一面著手〉，《法鼓佛學學報》第 6 期 (2010 年 6 月)，頁 57-114.

[延伸的參考材料]

* 蔡耀明，〈論「有無」並非適任的形上學概念：以《密嚴經》和《入楞伽經》為主要依據〉，《正觀》第 50 期 (2009 年 9 月)，頁 65-103.

* Mark Dennis, "Teaching Buddhist Philosophy in the College Classroom: "E-Prime" as a Pedagogical Tool," *The International Journal of the Humanities* 5/10 (2008): 137-140.

第 9 週 2012/04/20 [單元主題]：極致意義之彰顯／約定俗成之真實與極致意義之真實

* 蔡耀明，〈生命意義之佛教哲學的反思〉，《人文與社會科學簡訊》第 13 卷第 1 期 (2011 年 12 月)，頁 159-183.

* Jan Westerhoff, "The Merely Conventional Existence of the World," *Moonshadows: Conventional Truth in Buddhist Philosophy*, New York: Oxford University Press, 2011, pp. 189-212.

[延伸的參考材料]

* John Buescher, *Echoes from an Empty Sky: The Origins of the Buddhist Doctrine of the Two Truths*, Ithaca: Snow Lion, 2005.

* Douglas Duckworth, *Mipam on Buddha-Nature: The Ground of the Nyingma Tradition*, Albany: State University of New York, 2008.

* Guy Newland, *Appearance & Reality: The Two Truths in the Four Buddhist Tenet Systems*, Ithaca: Snow Lion, 1999.

* Sonam Thakchoe, *The Two Truths Debate: Tsongkhapa and Gorampa on the Middle Way*, Boston: Wisdom, 2007.

第10週2012/04/27〔單元主題〕：學員期中發表與討論

第11週2012/05/04〔單元主題〕：雖作是說而不如說／超過一切名言道

* 《大般若波羅蜜多經 (*Prajñāpāramitā-sūtra*) · 第十六會 · 般若波羅蜜多分》，唐·玄奘譯，大正藏第七冊 (T. 220 (16), vol. 7, pp. 1065c-1110b)。

〔延伸的參考材料〕

* Ryusho Hikata (ed.), *Suvikrāntavikrāmi-pariprcchā prajñāpāramitā sūtra* 《梵文善勇猛般若波羅蜜多經·序論文付》，Fukuoka: Kyushu University, 1958.

* Edward Conze (tr.), “The Questions of Suvikrāntavikrāmin,” *Perfect Wisdom: The Short Prajñāpāramitā Texts*, translated by Totnes: Buddhist Publishing Group, 1993, pp. 1-78.

* 蔡耀明，〈抉擇佛教所施設的多樣的修行道路之基本原則：以《大般若經·第四會·第十六會》為依據〉，收錄於《2008年佛學研究論文集：佛教與當代人文關懷》，佛光山文教基金會主編，(高雄：佛光山文教基金會，2008年8月)，頁263-286。

第12週2012/05/11〔單元主題〕：密咒與陀羅尼之語意、作用、與生性

* Robert Yelle, “Introduction: The Word and the World,” “Chapter 1: Opening the Puzzle Box: Mantras, Poetry, and Magic,” *Explaining Mantras: Ritual, Rhetoric, and the Dream of a Natural Language in Hindu Tantra*, New York: Routledge, 2003, pp. 2-8, 9-19, 124-125, 126-131.

* D. Smith, “Mantra,” *Concise Encyclopedia of Language and Religion*, edited by J.F.A. Sawyer and J.M.Y. Simpson, Amsterdam: Elsevier, 2001, pp. 262-264.

* I. Astley, “Dhāraṇī (root dhṛ, ‘to hold’),” *Concise Encyclopedia of Language and Religion*, edited by J.F.A. Sawyer and J.M.Y. Simpson, Amsterdam: Elsevier, 2001, pp. 244-245.

第13週2012/05/18〔單元主題〕：陀羅尼門／般若波羅蜜多為廣大之密咒

* 《大般若波羅蜜多經 (*Prajñāpāramitā-sūtra*) · 第二會 · 念住等品第十七、福生品第三十一》，唐·玄奘譯，大正藏第七冊 (T. 220 (2), vol. 7, pp. 81c-82b, 155a-157a)。

第14週2012/05/25〔單元主題〕：語言、矛盾、符應對象、實相

* **Johannes Bronkhorst, “Chapter 2: The Correspondence Principle -- Section 1: The Contradictions of Nāgārjuna; Section 2: The Reactions of Other Thinkers,”** *Language and Reality: On an Episode in Indian Thought*, Boston: Brill, 2011, pp. 37-46.

〔延伸的參考材料〕

* Kanti Das, Jyotish Basak (eds.), *Language and Reality*, New Delhi: Northern Book Centre, 2006.

* Michael Devitt, Kim Sterelny, *Language and Reality: An Introduction to the Philosophy of Language*, 2nd edition, Cambridge: MIT Press, 1999.

* Roy Harris, “Nagarjuna, Heraclitus and the Problem of Language,” *Rethinking Linguistics*, edited by Hayley Davis and Talbot Taylor, London: RoutledgeCurzon, 2003, pp. 171-188.

* Sydney Lamb, *Language and Reality*, London: Continuum, 2004.

第15週2012/06/01〔單元主題〕：心識運作與言說／離言法性

* 《解深密經 (*Samdhi-nirmocana Sūtra*)》，唐·玄奘譯，大正藏第十六冊 (T 676, vol. 16, pp. 688b-711b)，尤其 pp. 689a-b, 692, 694c.

〔延伸的參考材料〕

* John Powers, *Two Commentaries on the Samdhinirmocana Sutra by Asanga and Jnanagarbha*, Lewiston: Edwin Mellen, 1992.

* John Powers (tr.), *Wisdom of Buddha: The Samdhinirmocana Mahāyāna Sūtra*, Berkeley: Dharma, 1994.

* John Powers, *Jñānagarbha's Commentary on Just the Maitreya Chapter from the Samdhinirmocana-Sūtra: Study, Translation and Tibetan Text*, New Delhi: Indian Council of Philosophical Research, 1998.

第16週2012/06/08〔單元主題〕：感覺、推論、語言

* **Richard Hayes, “Sensation, Inference, and Language: Dignāga’s *Pramāṇasamuccaya*,”** *Buddhist Philosophy: Essential Readings*, edited by William Edelglass and Jay Garfield, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2009, pp. 107-115.

第17週2012/06/15〔單元主題〕：解構語言

* **Youru Wang, “Chapter 4: The Deconstruction of Buddha Nature in Chan Buddhism,”** *Linguistic Strategies in Daoist Zhuangzi and Chan Buddhism: The Other Way of Speaking*, London: RoutledgeCurzon, 2003, pp. 52-80, 199-204.

〔延伸的參考材料〕

* Desheng Zong, “Three Language-related Methods in Early Chinese Chan Buddhism,” *Philosophy East & West* 55/4 (October 2005): 584-602.

第18週 2012/06/22〔單元主題〕：期末報告